Locating gender in the
APPROACH
FIVE
YEAR PLAN

APPREACH
Issues emerging from a gendered analysis
Locating Gender in the Twelfth Five Year Plan Approach: Issues Emerging from a Gendered Analysis
Acknowledgments

This document is a more detailed version of the presentation titled “Towards Economic Growth: Ideas Emerging from Gendered Analysis” prepared by the Working Group of Feminist Economists in the context of the Twelfth Plan Approach and shared with the Planning Commission. It is based on a framework prepared by Nirmala Banerjee and Maithreyi Krishnaraj and inputs provided by Ritu Dewan, Devaki Jain, Renana Jhabwala, Jayati Ghosh, Indira Hirway, Mary E. John, Santosh Mehrotra, Bina Agarwal, Ratna Sudarshan and Padmini Swaminathan.

Contributions by Swapna Bist Joshi and Navanita Sinha are acknowledged. Support provided by UN Women in the preparation of this document is gratefully acknowledged. Ideas drawn from a paper on “Gendering the 12th Plan: A Feminist Perspective” (Economic and Political Weekly, April 28, 2012) by some members of this group are also acknowledged.

Aasha Kapur Mehta
Mridul Eapen
Yamini Mishra
**Abbreviations and Acronyms**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Acronym</th>
<th>Full Form</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ASHAs</td>
<td>Accredited Social Health Activists</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AWH</td>
<td>Anganwadi helpers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AWW</td>
<td>Anganwadi workers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BPL</td>
<td>Below Poverty Line</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CBO</td>
<td>Community Based Organizations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHCs</td>
<td>Community Health Centres</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GBS</td>
<td>Gender Budget Statement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GDP</td>
<td>Gross Domestic Product</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GE</td>
<td>Gender Equality</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GoI</td>
<td>Government of India</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GRB</td>
<td>Gender Responsive Budgeting</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HIV/AIDS</td>
<td>Human Immunodeficiency Virus / Acquired Immunodeficiency Syndrome</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IAY</td>
<td>Indira Awas Yojana</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IDP</td>
<td>Internally Displaced People</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ILO</td>
<td>International Labour Organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IWDW</td>
<td>Integrated Watershed Development Programme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LPG</td>
<td>Liquefied Petroleum Gas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MDM</td>
<td>Mid Day Meal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MFI</td>
<td>Micro Finance Institution</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MGNREGA</td>
<td>Mahatma Gandhi National Rural Employment Guarantee Act</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MKSP</td>
<td>Mahila Kisan Sashaktikaran Pariyojana</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MoHFW</td>
<td>Ministry of Health and Family Welfare</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NCEUS</td>
<td>National Commission for Enterprises in the Unorganised Sector</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NFHS</td>
<td>National Family Health Survey</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NGO</td>
<td>Non Government Organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NRDWP</td>
<td>National Rural Drinking Water Programme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NRM</td>
<td>National Rural Livelihoods Mission</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NSA</td>
<td>Net Sown Area</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NSAP</td>
<td>National Social Assistance Programme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NSSO</td>
<td>National Sample Survey Organisation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NTFP</td>
<td>Non-Timber Forest Products</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OBCs</td>
<td>Other Backward Classes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PDS</td>
<td>Public Distribution System</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PHCs</td>
<td>Primary Health Centres</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PMGSY</td>
<td>Pradhan Mantri Gram Sadak Yojana</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PPP</td>
<td>Public Private Partnership</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PRI</td>
<td>Panchayati Raj Institutions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R&amp;D</td>
<td>Research and Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RGAVY</td>
<td>Rajiv Gandhi Gramin Vikas Yojana</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RKVY</td>
<td>Rashtriya Krishi Vikas Yojana</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RMK</td>
<td>Rashtriya Mahila Kosh</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RSBY</td>
<td>Rashtriya Swasthya Bima Yojana</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RTI</td>
<td>Reproductive Tract Infection</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S&amp;T</td>
<td>Science and Technology</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SBL</td>
<td>SHG-Bank Linkage</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SCs</td>
<td>Scheduled Castes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SCSP</td>
<td>Scheduled Caste Sub Plan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SEWA</td>
<td>Self-Employed Women's Association</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SEZ</td>
<td>Special Economic Zones</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SGSY</td>
<td>Swarnajayanti Gram Swarozgar Yojana</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SHG</td>
<td>Self Help Group</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Policy approaches to women and development in India have changed over more than fifty years of planned development. But, the shift from ‘welfare’ based (women seen primarily as mothers/wives and passive beneficiaries) to an ‘empowerment’ approach (women as self reliant and active participants in development), has remained more in the realm of the rhetoric. Despite several decades of struggle by women’s groups to make policy gender sensitive, the approach to the Twelfth Plan too, exhibits insufficient awareness of the specific problems of women, their unpaid labour and their distinctive economic contribution to the nation’s economy.

The Eleventh Plan (2007-12) aimed at achieving “faster and more inclusive growth.” During the preparation of the Eleventh Five-Year Plan (2007-2012), the Planning Commission set up a Working Group of Feminist Economists (WGFE) to review the sectoral chapters of the Eleventh Plan through a gender lens. The Group critiqued the Approach to the Eleventh Plan for its limited view of “inclusive growth” – namely “inclusion” was an add-on to “growth” rather than intrinsic to the growth process itself. In particular, it had insufficiently acknowledged women as economic agents who directly contribute to growth, rather than being recipients of welfare or development. Engaging with the draft chapters, the Group, establishing the primacy of women and their work in India’s growth achievements, argued that the planning processes and methods exhibited an inadequate awareness of these facts. The value of this initiative was that it argued for moving beyond a special focus on women and children to looking at women as growth agents in all sectors across the political economy of India. Thus, the major shift through this initiative was to move the engendering of public policy into the macroeconomic space.

In preparing the Approach to the Twelfth Plan, the Planning Commission engaged in a wide consultative exercise that covered different parts of India and involved a varied group of what are now called ‘stakeholders’. The resulting document indicates some awareness of the complex problems that the Indian economy is likely to face in the coming period. Unfortunately, it falls short of expectations because once again it exposes a major limitation of the overall planning model of the Indian state. On the one hand, while it claims to plan for the macro-economy as a whole, the actual plans are for each line department. Thus, for them to be partners in growth, some of the major components of inclusive growth; especially those that have significant gender implications are detailed below:

1. **Employment and livelihoods:** ‘Lifelihood’ led growth should be at the centre of inclusive growth. This requires — correcting the existing trend of jobless growth that has excluded women and disadvantaged socio-economic groups from the growth process; providing capabilities that are linked to productive employment opportunities; using more intensively the factors of production owned by groups that are poor to increasing their productivity; and directing investment flows and infrastructure development to spatially disadvantaged locations where the excluded are concentrated.

2. **Agriculture and allied sectors:** The Twelfth Plan seeks to achieve 4 per cent or more agricultural growth. The role of women farmers will be critical in achieving this goal since the feminization of agriculture is growing. Research and development to increase yields of coarse cereals, pulses, oilseeds, and vegetables must be encouraged as this would encourage production of crops that are of nutritious value and provide food security.

3. **Macroeconomic environment:** Monetary, fiscal and international trade related policies, being closely intertwined with women’s multiple roles in the economy, must take cognisance of their gendered impact, for example, in terms of women’s poor access to credit.

II. What do we Mean by Inclusion?

Economic growth is a pre-condition for inclusive growth. However, the nature and composition of growth has to be conducive to inclusion. Growth has to include the poor — especially women, ethnically disadvantaged groups, as well as deprived regions — not as beneficiaries but as partners in the process. In other words, as argued earlier by the WGFE, inclusion needs to be embedded in the growth process. It, therefore, has to explicitly address the constraints faced by the excluded and the marginalized and provide opportunities for them to be partners in growth. Some of the specific questions and problems that need to be addressed are:

4. **Employment and livelihoods:** ‘Lifelihood’ led growth should be at the centre of inclusive growth. This requires — correcting the existing trend of jobless growth that has excluded women and disadvantaged socio-economic groups from the growth process; providing capabilities that are linked to productive employment opportunities; using more intensively the factors of production owned by groups that are poor to increasing their productivity; and directing investment flows and infrastructure development to spatially disadvantaged locations where the excluded are concentrated.

5. **Agriculture and allied sectors:** The Twelfth Plan seeks to achieve 4 per cent or more agricultural growth. The role of women farmers will be critical in achieving this goal since the feminization of agriculture is growing. Research and development to increase yields of coarse cereals, pulses, oilseeds, and vegetables must be encouraged as this would encourage production of crops that are of nutritious value and provide food security.

6. **Macroeconomic environment:** Monetary, fiscal and international trade related policies, being closely intertwined with women’s multiple roles in the economy, must take cognisance of their gendered impact, for example, in terms of women’s poor access to credit.

7. **Environment and sustainable development:** Preventing displacement and environmental degradation are two of the major components of inclusive growth; especially those that have significant gender implications are detailed below:

8. **Economic growth is a pre-condition for inclusive growth. However, the nature and composition of growth has to be conducive to inclusion. Growth has to include the poor — especially women, ethnically disadvantaged groups, as well as deprived regions — not as beneficiaries but as partners in the process. In other words, as argued earlier by the WGFE, inclusion needs to be embedded in the growth process. It, therefore, has to explicitly address the constraints faced by the excluded and the marginalized and provide opportunities for them to be partners in growth. Some of the specific questions and problems that need to be addressed are:**

I. Introduction: Inclusive Growth is Elusive

While the Approach Paper draws attention to the achievement of an average GDP growth of around 8.2 per cent (targeted for the Eleventh Plan period), it shies away from providing a report card on ‘inclusiveness’ for recent years due to lack of relevant data. There is little evidence to show that the accelerated growth rate of the economy during the Eleventh Plan led to any significant achievement of inclusion. It deflected responsibility for achieving inclusiveness by stating that “success depends not only on introducing new policies and government programmes, but on institutional and attitudinal changes, which take time”. Further, it notes that there have been “gains on many of these fronts, even though there are shortfalls for which further work is needed.” In other words, inclusiveness has remained elusive.

Even the limited focus given to inclusion and equity in the Eleventh Plan appears to have been jettisoned in the Twelfth Plan Approach, which focuses narrowly only on growth per se, assuming growth will ensure an improvement in the lives of people overall. The paragraphs on inclusion in the Introduction to the Approach Paper are particularly weak as they remain at the level of general intentions. There is lack of clarity regarding how inclusion will occur. What are the mechanisms for incentivizing this? How will inclusiveness be measured? How will inclusiveness be continuously monitored over the Plan period?

There is no ‘single bullet’ solution to ensure inclusion, and we know that it leads to greater complexity, both in programme design and appraisal. These are critical questions that must be addressed, because without a roadmap for achieving inclusion, this objective will not be achieved in the Twelfth Plan.

1. **Employment and livelihoods:** ‘Lifelihood’ led growth should be at the centre of inclusive growth. This requires — correcting the existing trend of jobless growth that has excluded women and disadvantaged socio-economic groups from the growth process; providing capabilities that are linked to productive employment opportunities; using more intensively the factors of production owned by groups that are poor to increasing their productivity; and directing investment flows and infrastructure development to spatially disadvantaged locations where the excluded are concentrated.

2. **Agriculture and allied sectors:** The Twelfth Plan seeks to achieve 4 per cent or more agricultural growth. The role of women farmers will be critical in achieving this goal since the feminization of agriculture is growing. Research and development to increase yields of coarse cereals, pulses, oilseeds, and vegetables must be encouraged as this would encourage production of crops that are of nutritious value and provide food security.

3. **Macroeconomic environment:** Monetary, fiscal and international trade related policies, being closely intertwined with women’s multiple roles in the economy, must take cognisance of their gendered impact, for example, in terms of women’s poor access to credit.

4. **Environment and sustainable development:** Preventing displacement and environmental degradation are two of the major components of inclusive growth; especially those that have significant gender implications are detailed below:

   1. **Economic growth is a pre-condition for inclusive growth. However, the nature and composition of growth has to be conducive to inclusion. Growth has to include the poor — especially women, ethnically disadvantaged groups, as well as deprived regions — not as beneficiaries but as partners in the process. In other words, as argued earlier by the WGFE, inclusion needs to be embedded in the growth process. It, therefore, has to explicitly address the constraints faced by the excluded and the marginalized and provide opportunities for them to be partners in growth. Some of the specific questions and problems that need to be addressed are:**

5. **Employment and livelihoods:** ‘Lifelihood’ led growth should be at the centre of inclusive growth. This requires — correcting the existing trend of jobless growth that has excluded women and disadvantaged socio-economic groups from the growth process; providing capabilities that are linked to productive employment opportunities; using more intensively the factors of production owned by groups that are poor to increasing their productivity; and directing investment flows and infrastructure development to spatially disadvantaged locations where the excluded are concentrated.

6. **Agriculture and allied sectors:** The Twelfth Plan seeks to achieve 4 per cent or more agricultural growth. The role of women farmers will be critical in achieving this goal since the feminization of agriculture is growing. Research and development to increase yields of coarse cereals, pulses, oilseeds, and vegetables must be encouraged as this would encourage production of crops that are of nutritious value and provide food security.

7. **Macroeconomic environment:** Monetary, fiscal and international trade related policies, being closely intertwined with women’s multiple roles in the economy, must take cognisance of their gendered impact, for example, in terms of women’s poor access to credit.

8. **Environment and sustainable development:** Preventing displacement and environmental degradation are two of the major components of inclusive growth; especially those that have significant gender implications are detailed below:

   1. **Economic growth is a pre-condition for inclusive growth. However, the nature and composition of growth has to be conducive to inclusion. Growth has to include the poor — especially women, ethnically disadvantaged groups, as well as deprived regions — not as beneficiaries but as partners in the process. In other words, as argued earlier by the WGFE, inclusion needs to be embedded in the growth process. It, therefore, has to explicitly address the constraints faced by the excluded and the marginalized and provide opportunities for them to be partners in growth. Some of the specific questions and problems that need to be addressed are:**
goal of Planning and the pivot of the Twelfth Plan. Employment is the single most important variable for the goal of Planning and the pivot of the Twelfth Plan.

While part of this decline in female employment may be due to increased educational participation, it is critical to recognise that the Twelfth Plan period will witness a significant increase in the number of educated youth seeking jobs, many of whom would have spent scarce resources on privatised higher/technical education and will expect jobs that allow them to repay loans or recoup investment. There is, therefore, an urgent need for decent employment and to improve conditions of informal and self-employed workers.

Unemployment and discrimination on grounds of caste, community and gender are explosive political and social issues. The rise in unemployment in labour market is a social indicator, education in particular, for these groups, which however continue to be much lower than for the general categories. Spatially too, the distribution of benefits from economic growth since the early 1990s has followed an identifiable pattern. Per capita income adjusted for inflation fell between 1993 and 2005 for people in villages located more than five km. from the nearest town; this is where half of India’s population resides. The steepest decline was experienced by the lowest income groups. This debilitating effect must be countered by better physical and social infrastructure.

The problem is particularly critical for women who have been losing jobs during the Eleventh Plan period and have found few new work opportunities except in domestic services, apart from teaching in urban areas. The need to rethink the growth strategy is urgent because a large population of young people – the much discussed demographic dividend – are set to enter the labour market in the next few years, and the large proportion of whom have accessed education including higher education. Among them, young women are going face greater difficulties in finding work. The few fresh work opportunities that have opened up for women have been in occupations that the educated young among them are unlikely to find palatable. Exclusion of these young women from the process of development can have serious implications for the future of India’s democracy.

Significant increases in public employment must be created in health, sanitation, education, and social indicators, education in particular, for these groups, which however continue to be much lower than for the general categories. Spatially too, the distribution of benefits from economic growth since the early 1990s has followed an identifiable pattern. Per capita income adjusted for inflation fell between 1993 and 2005 for people in villages located more than five km. from the nearest town; this is where half of India’s population resides. The steepest decline was experienced by the lowest income groups. This debilitating effect must be countered by better physical and social infrastructure.

In the vision of the planners, the primary focus tends to be on an increase in GDP, independent of its distribution. However, the focus also needs to be on the composition of that output and the means used for achieving it as well as the strategy of growth. Maximal employment is the goal of economic behaviour according to conventional ‘rationality’. But the reality in developing economics is that households, especially poor groups and women, seek to maximise not returns but the wellbeing of the group to which they regard themselves as accountable. Women regard the wellbeing of the family and children as the main purpose of economic production. Concurrently, productive resources like capital, technology and support systems like credit and favourable laws that recognise their vulnerabilities, women’s labour, both outside and inside the household endures more costs and receives poor returns. There are many kinds of efforts to estimate the enormous unpaid labour of women that sustains the household. Hence, estimates of extended GDP should be presented together with GDP.

As stated earlier, in the view of the planners, if gains from growth do not trickle down to all as expected, equity among citizens is to be ensured through special policies that cater to the needs of vulnerable sections. Perhaps this is why the Approach Paper is not overly concerned about the failure of the economy in generating additional employment during the Eleventh Plan period.

However, in our view, the primary purpose of the State undertaking planned growth is not just to ensure that those who are already in the mainstream of the economy also to correct historical inequities and address factors constraining their participation in the growth process. The inclusion of all sections of population in the process of development can be seen from three angles:

• That all sections of people in the labour force are included as productive workers and contribute to national product growth.
• That all of them get an equitable share in the benefits of development.
• That the contributions and needs of those who have been neglected get due recognition.

This paper aims to view all these three objectives from a gendered lens and to identify the gaps in the design of the Twelfth Plan for different sectors in that light. It also gives concrete suggestions about the possible actions that can not only be equitable but also efficient in promoting faster growth.

(a) Inclusion as Workers

For inclusive growth, it is essential that all potential workers find remunerative employment in the mainstream of development. That is to say, generating productive work has to be an integral part of the plan model. It is now officially acknowledged that economic ‘development’ has not just witnessed the growth of the informal sector and of those being employed informally, but also the phenomenon of the ‘formalization of the formal sector’. Further, there is remarkable inequity of opportunities for men and women. Women and their ‘work’ either become invisible in data systems or get captured in categories that fall outside the purview of protection legislation. The organised or formal economy supposedly enjoys the protection of labour laws with some modicum of social security, but even this apparent protection is elusive. The National Commission for Enterprises in the Unorganised Sector (2009) estimated the effectiveness of the coverage of important labour laws for the year 1999-2000. Among other things, the exercise revealed that the rate of coverage as far as the Maternity Benefit Act, 1961 was concerned was only 16 per cent. The International Labour Organization’s recently concluded evaluation of maternity benefit schemes in India, carried this exercise further and revealed the manner in which eligible women workers were denied maternity benefits statutorily due to them.12

The outcome of the Eleventh Plan’s efforts are especially worrying because, while the national product grew at an unprecedented fast rate, overall employment was virtually stagnant; it grew at a rate that was less than a third of the rate during the previous plan period. In the case of women, the rate of growth of employment was actually negative. Claiming that the rate was low not because of a demand constraint but due to a supply constraint in the labour market can only be a temporary solace.

The youth who did not join the labour market during the Eleventh Plan period, since they were involved in educational pursuits, will become part of this market during the Twelfth Plan period. Also, these better educated young people are bound to have greater expectations regarding the quality and quantity of employment available to them. What has shown a significant jump in the last decade is ‘home-based’ work, which increased from 29 million persons in 1999-2000 to 40 million in 2009-10 (NSSO, 67th Round). A large number of women are involved in home-based work. However, since home-based work conditions are poor, there has been very little growth in decent work for women when work has been created.

One positive effect of an employment-oriented macroeconomic strategy that is often missed is the possibility of using social policy and social expenditure to generate more employment, which not only improves the quality of life of the people but also has very strong multiplier effects. Increased public spending on health, sanitation, 6

---

7 Chandrasekhar and Ghosh, 2012.
10 Kaniar and Rainbird, 2011.
12 Kohli, 2006.
education and other essential public services should be associated with the provision of regular and good quality jobs in these sectors, rather than the current exploitation of underpaid para-professionals including Anganwadi workers and helpers, para teachers, and ASHAS (Accredited Social Health Activists), who increasingly carry the burden of service delivery. Additional resources are required for state governments to ensure regular employment in the field of providing necessary services and ensuring that these opportunities meet minimum labour standards. All contractors of outsourced public activities must meet minimum labour standards, including those in construction, infrastructural development, and other services. Health, safety, maternity benefits and other social protection measures must be fully met for all workers involved directly and indirectly in such public activities.

Similarly, active labour market policies are required to provide incentives for private sector employers to hire women workers and provide decent conditions.

Legislation is needed to ensure better conditions for domestic workers and migrants.

**The Condition of Women in this Context**

a. An important fact is that if women did withdraw from the labour force during the last plan period, this is largely because of the terms on which work was available to them. Whether in self-employment or piece-rate work, the terms were too poor to be worth their effort. It is not that they did not need the work; after all, during the same period, large numbers of rural women undertook to migrate singly or commute daily to seek work mainly in unorganised, urban domestic service. The increase in urban domestic service of 3 million between the years 2000 to 2005 indicates that women were not reluctant to work; rather the quality of alternative job opportunities available to them was deteriorating. Currently, the single largest public policy measure for promoting women’s economic activities is to provide micro-credit for promoting self-employment among them. However, studies have shown that the capital provided to women’s groups for generating self-employment can at best create part-time, supplementary work.

b. Without the dedicated support (from NGOs, Banks, MFIs), it is difficult for poor women to design and execute viable new enterprises.

c. They usually end up putting the money in family activities controlled by men or using it to expand their existing poor quality enterprises.

d. In many instances, expanding existing businesses have driven down piece rates for the work that women had been doing.

e. By focusing almost exclusively on microfinance, the State transfers its responsibility of providing employment to women by insisting that they undertake their own economic empowerment through ‘assisted’ self-employment.

Including Women in Developmental Activities

Livelihood Missions like the large National Rural Livelihood Mission (NRLM) launched in 2011 will not be successful unless they take account of the macroeconomic context and demand for goods and services. The NRLM’s focus on creating producer (self help) groups will be effective only if it involves improved access to inputs, credit, marketing and technology. It is important that (i) incentives such as those that are offered for corporates in downsizing should be offered to a greater extent for small producers; (ii) there should be enhanced access to institutional credit – not microfinance – to small producers of goods and services, especially women who are normally excluded; (iii) efforts should be made for technological improvement in the production processes, especially in agriculture. Providing training in new labour-saving technologies and subsidies oriented towards this; and (iv) the Skill Development Mission may be involved in this.

There is an important dimension of NRLM different from credit lending to SHGs in the earlier schemes which is founded on the universally acknowledged success of the design of Velugu in Andhra Pradesh and Kudumbashree in Kerala. It ensures a back-end subsidy to borrowing groups. That means that when the banks or other self-help groups of their loan, the banks give them back money, enough to reduce their effective interest rate on the loan from 12 per cent to 3 per cent for the entire loan – it is a subsidy that the Government of India gives. However, the proposal to deepen financial inclusion does not discuss how this will be implemented or mention women as a significant target group. In the absence of such clarification, the concern is that SHG-Bank Linkage (SBL) will be seen as financial inclusion for women, which is not genuine financial inclusion.

A livelihood is more than the immediate means of earning a living; it comprises people, their capabilities and the means of living, including food, income and tangible assets. Tangible assets are resources and stores and intangible assets are claims and access. A livelihood is environmentally sustainable when it maintains or enhances the local and global access upon which livelihoods depend, and confers net benefits than the other. Livelihoods are socially sustainable if it can cope with or recover from stress and shocks and provide for future generations.

There is an urgent need for policy makers to take cognisance of the roles women have traditionally played in many vital sectors of the economy. Improving their productivity in those occupations will not only be equitable but will also lead to a more efficient use of national resources. Some of the significant sectors where change needs to be urgently brought about are outlined below.

**Agriculture and Allied Activities**

One of the key roles of women is in the farm sector where their share of the workforce has increased as men move to non-farm activities. Most farms are small and marginal in size. This is the section of farming where planners will have to focus their policies if they are to achieve the plan target of 4 per cent per annum growth of primary produce, because currently over three quarters of all cultivable land falls in this group. New technological enterprises, including low-caste cultivation services. The NRLM’s focus on creating producer (self help) groups will be effective only if it involves improved access to inputs, credit, marketing and technology. It is important that (i) incentives such as those that are offered for corporates in downsizing should be offered to a greater extent for small producers; (ii) there should be enhanced access to institutional credit – not microfinance – to small producers of goods and services, especially women who are normally excluded; (iii) efforts should be made for technological improvement in the production processes, especially in agriculture. Providing training in new labour-saving technologies and subsidies oriented towards this; and (iv) the Skill Development Mission may be involved in this.

As cultivators confined mainly to small or marginal plots (paid work as agricultural labour is becoming increasingly scarce for women), it has been difficult to increase women’s productivity. This difficulty can be overcome by encouraging rural self-help groups to provide cheap credit to women to lease-in land and pool their plots to apply better inputs, and providing them with training in innovative women-friendly technologies. Providing training in improved farming techniques and including women in such training is required if agriculture productivity is to be increased. Unless we boost productivity in this sector, neither reduction in poverty nor industrial progress is feasible. Adequate capital investment, credit, technology and market outlets are required for this sector that has not escaped the notice of the Planning Commission. It notes that “much larger numbers of educated youth will be joining the labour force in increasing numbers during the Twelfth Plan and in the years beyond. The clear implication of this is that the pace of job/livelihood creation must be greatly accelerated”12. However, the poor performance of the economy in terms of employment generation in the recent quinquennium casts serious doubts on the possibility of increasing its pace substantially in the coming five years.

**Manufacturing**

The manufacturing sector currently poses a serious problem for the Indian economy. Despite

---

1 Chambers and Convey, 1991.
The main reason for the sector's malaise is the per cent over that period. Even though manufacturing output employment actually declined in the period 2004-2009, what makes the GDP and neglects other concerns. Methods by which such a massive number of jobs are to be created are stressed. What makes the projection particularly brave is that manufacturing employment actually declined in the period 2004-2009, even though manufacturing output grew at an annual compound rate of more than 8 per cent over that period.

The main reason for the sector’s malaise is the decline of the traditional household sector where a large number of workers had been employed in decentralized units throughout the country. These units accounted for a large portion of the output of goods from both local and global markets, many of which have very high skill content and have contributed significantly to our foreign exchange earnings. It is difficult to see how the planners can fulfill their target of tripling manufacturing output over the next ten years without reviving these units.

With the availability of computerised technology, manufacturing can once again be decentralized as has been happening in many globally important industries. In India, too, growth of production during recent years has chiefly been in small and medium units and planners are aware that their flexibility and capacity to absorb new skills has given them an edge in growth over the factory sector. However, although traditional workers are also known for these capacities for rapid adjustments, they do not find a mention in the Approach Paper. Worse still, the document has ignored women workers, perhaps because of the misplaced belief that they are incapable of absorbing modern skills. But traditionally, the sector has always been the largest venue of employment for women after farm work; their skills often have been acquired generically and they are decentralized to suit women with limited mobility.

Planners too appreciate the need to promote decentralized growth of the manufacturing sector. For this, they have proposed setting up several new industrial areas and in the way they propose to do this does not acknowledge the reality of the problem. Developing new areas and putting in the necessary infrastructure for building such clusters cannot be a long-drawn-out process. And experience from the past has shown that opening industrial areas in the industrial areas in the world-wide pattern of economic development. With the availability of computerised technology, units and planners are aware that their flexibility and social mobility of people, especially women. Transportation in fact, is an essential indicator of the quality of life, and of development itself. Thus transportation needs to be viewed not merely as a support of handrails, ramps, etc.) and demarcated exclusive parking lots, bus stops, airports, highways, etc.) and demarcated exclusive access to clean toilet facilities with running water and security. Personal security risks (in buses, at railway stations, in mofussil bus stations.)

Lack of access to transport facilities has a differential effect on the productive, domestic and community management roles of men and women. For instance, in mountain regions such as Uttarakhand, the combined impact of living in far flung habitats and lack of road connectivity (with just pagdandis or slippery stones during rains or snow) leads to lack of mobility especially for women and girls and poor access to most facilities. This results in high untreated morbidity and mortality due to difficulty in accessing health services, inability of mobile health vans to reach habitats due to lack of roads; unwillingness of teachers to travel long distances to schools; high dropout rates of girls due to distance of schools; lack of access to electricity; wastage of time and drudgery due to carrying head loads of food grains and other raw materials; and unwillingness of agricultural extension workers and horticulturalists to support people to difficult access; and the risk of accidents and lack of safety. Likewise, in the desert areas of Rajasthan, poor connectivity of dharmis means having to walk on sand for hours to reach a road. Combined with infrequent buses, the effect here is the same as that in hilly areas.

In the context of gender friendly infrastructure, access to clean toilet facilities with running water and without user charge on highways as well as near roads within the city, cannot be adequately stressed. The loss of revenue from not charging a user fee will be more than made up for by the benefits of reduced mortality, lower incidence of diseases. Other measures include, prominently displayed and functional helpline numbers that women can call in case of need; separate counters and helpdesks; gender sensitive pre-paid taxi booths at all entry points to a city - whether bus stops, railway stations or airports; increased numbers of women bus drivers, conductors, auto and taxi drivers.

Investment in large infrastructure projects such as highways, ports, airports, dams, SEZs, etc., results in dispossession and livelihood destruction. This raises fundamental questions regarding the levels of intervention for infrastructural empowerment, the efficiency, efficacy, and ethics of major-medium-minor, which are closely linked to gendered manifestations at macro-meso-micro levels. Illustrations include the non-regulation of facilities and basic amenities in easy-to-monitor structures such as SEZs, Export Promotion Zones, industrial estates, resettlement colonies, sugar-factory camps, etc.

Gendered infrastructural empowerment is obvious in the several levels of interconnections. Firstly, the reduction of time-consuming drudgery with investment and improvement in water supply, sanitation, energy, and transport. Secondly, the inter-linkages between community planning, environmental improvements and water supply; sanitation; drainage; tertiary irrigation canals; transport. Thirdly, increased income and economic and social empowerment through improved transport. Lastly, political and administrative empowerment through being vested with the responsibility of managing revenue collection resources.

There are several ways in which gender-sensitive policies can be implemented in the planning and implementation policies include pre-project rapid gender assessment surveys; gender-sensitive project coordination and team and appropriate institutional structures; participatory project planning and implementation with women and men in communities, including procurement activities; women’s participation and decision-making in community infrastructure management; women’s participation in generating and operating maintenance funds; promotion of local cooperatives and SHGs for provision of materials; special concessions for women and child-headed households, pregnant women, MGNREGA households; financial resources for capacity building and training of local authorities; dissemination of anti-gender biases for operation, management, and maintenance of public infrastructure; collection of sex-disaggregated data; systematic institutionalised evaluation through use of appropriate gender budgeting tools for each project and sub-sector;
In this context it is essential to know how our employment over the decade has been critical in generating employment absolute size of employment in non-manufacturing services, has been shown and written about by a range of scholars including gender studies scholars, that the Second National Commission of Labour has recorded in considerable detail and with medical evidence about the exploitative and health-impairing conditions of work (for women in particular) in the sector - does not find even a passing mention.

There is urgent need to change the approach to tourism which is being projected as a major potential employment avenue for women in the Twelfth Plan. The emphasis on ‘showcasing something’ for foreign consumption and approval’, has detracted us from approaching our cultural heritage as a cluster of places and symbols that are rich in the socio-political history of the place and its people. A change in this approach will enable us to provide out-of-box solutions such as, getting students of History, Culture, Folklore, Fine Arts, etc. to work with the communities, and officials concerned to suggest and preside over the development of a place, so that it enriches and simultaneously serves different purposes, and over time, the pejorative term ‘tourist’ that now characterizes most of our places of tourism activity is not sustained. This has to be sync with this understanding of tourism. Right now, a lot of emphasis in tourism is laid on sub-sectors such as medical tourism around which a whole industry has sprouted with no agency officially in-charge of regulating this growth.

In fact, considerable thought needs to be given to how much, and, what kind of ‘development’ is permissible in and around designated areas of socio-cultural importance. It is also crucial to address issues on which existing institutions will oversee the ‘development’; maintenance, change, etc., with what authority and to whom it will report. If existing institutions need to be strengthened with relevant expertise, revamped to give them more teeth and resources, then these are the areas where the Approach Paper needs to flag.

The operational word here is ‘services’ and we all know that as far as employment of women is concerned, urban women in particular, data thus far reveals considerable numbers of women employed as domestics, a component that has been shown to be increasing over the years. Domestic workers, as a category, do not figure in the Approach Paper.

It is unclear why the section on ‘Services’ is silent on the growing component of domestic labour (largely women) in the country. In this context, it becomes imperative as stated earlier that some clarity is provided on what constitutes ‘services’.

(b) Ensuring an equitable share in the benefits of development

Inclusive growth implies that the gains of development are shared between all citizens in ways that are just. This is to say, the state takes positive action to compensate the traditional disadvantages of the weak, the deprived and the vulnerable so that each citizen attains a minimal level of capabilities necessary for survival and functioning. India’s record in this regard is far from satisfactory; inequalities on grounds of religion, caste and ethnicity are rampant and these get compounded for women of all groups on grounds of gender. An unacceptably large section of the population, among whom women form the majority, still continues to suffer from hunger, ill-health and ignorance.

Education and Skill Development

Access to education and skill training exemplifies these failures; despite the constitutional provision of a right to education and the Sarva Shiksha Abhiyan campaign, there are still persistent gaps in access to education on all the grounds of discrimination mentioned above and regrettably, this time too, policy makers do not appear to have any vision for redressing that situation. A large part of the responsibility of early child education is left largely to under-paid female teachers who, in spite of being state employees, are being denied any of the workers’ rights.

The Plan approach to education and skills, views a well educated population, adequately equipped with skills, as a pre-condition for growth to be inclusive. The Twelfth Plan must pick up the challenge of ensuring that all children, including differently-abled children enjoy equal access to education and educational institutions. It is stated that “a concerted effort is needed to strengthen the system at all levels: elementary education, secondary and higher secondary education and higher education…”

The Eleventh Plan was also called the education plan, because it provided for a four fold increase in education outlays overall, within which, special attention was given to secondary and higher education. With a focus on ‘expansion, excellence and equity’, the government had set up committees and commissions such as the National Knowledge Commission and the Rashtriya Talat Samiti, which offered significant recommendations regarding educational reform at all levels.

The planners make no mention regarding action on the recommendations made by the various commissions and committees set up during the Eleventh Plan. There is an intention to bring in the ‘private for profit’ model into educational institutions. The emphasis on the PPP model for all levels of education must be backed by evidence and justifications to show how the model has been successful either in extending the facilities to the deprived or in generally improving the quality of education. Contrary to the claims made, there is no evidence that quality is somehow assured under such conditions; rather, the proliferation of commercially-led educational institutions of dubious quality in several states points to the opposite trend.

Moreover, as far as equity is concerned, commercially profitable educational institutions privilege those with the capacity to pay huge fees or they are able to discriminate against those who cannot pay exorbitant fees. There is evidence in existing studies that parents discriminate between daughters and sons when it comes to education and healthcare, by sending sons to what are considered ‘better’ private facilities.

The argument for PPPs in several sectors, including education, is based on the premise that there is a shortage of resources with the state. However, PPPs require provision of public funds or public resources in the form of land and other resources to private players. There is a lack of evidence of the working of such PPPs in ways that favour those in positions of disadvantage, since public money and assets are involved. Remarkably, no such evidence is provided. Rather, the state ought to be considering better ways of regulating the private sector whether in education or health, in order to ensure genuine quality in services.

The impact of this on employability extends far beyond simply increasing the aggregate rate of job creation. As the Approach Paper has highlighted, one reason why employment growth was slower in the most recent period is actually because of the growing involvement of young men and women in higher stages of education. While this is good

---

16. Malthra et al., 2012
news, it also means that there will be more and more young people entering the labour market with higher qualifications, expecting to find employment that is commensurate to their education. Thus the likelihood too has not escaped the notice of the Planning Commission, as noted earlier.

Much of the increased enrolment in education has been in the private sector. The Approach Paper notes that private higher education currently accounts for about four-fifths of the enrolment in professional higher education and one-third overall. Most of these – especially the professional courses – are associated with high user fees. Families across the country now put most of their hopes in educating the young as a means for social and economic advancement. Where access to good public educational institutions is limited, which is increasingly the case, such families educate their young at enormous cost, selling assets and being burdened in order to pay the high fees.

However, the bulk of such private institutions do not live on their fees. In terms of ensuring employment or even employability. Examples are rife, of graduates with engineering, management courses – are associated with high user fees. The poor quality of education in such degrees. But, the poor quality of education in the system itself is simply not generating enough of the kinds of jobs that are demanded by those with such degrees. But, the poor quality of education in many institutions, both public and private, is also a part of the problem.

Yet again, despite ground realities, the government persists with privileging private schools. In light of this experience and the slow progress in building Kendriya Vidyalayas and Navodaya Vidyalayas across the country (as brought out by the Eleventh Plan Mid Term Appraisal), plans must be put in place to expand the number of these schools substantially rather than attempting to involve the private sector in setting up more schools.

There is also no reason to believe that the PPP model will cater to the urgent need for skill training and upgrading of numerous workers in the unorganised sector who, as mentioned before, can find no markets for their traditional skills unless these are coupled with modern inputs and some entrepreneurial skills. To universalise access to these skills at all levels and to all social groups, the state needs to promote flexible vocational school education as well as enterprise level training that is sensitive to local opportunities and traditional skills. The Twelfth Plan must take on the challenge of ensuring that all children, including differently-abled children are able to enjoy equal access to educational and educational institutions.

Health
The most glaring form of gender discrimination is in the health sector where it is visibly manifested in the sex ratio, high levels of morbidity and female-male differentials in morbidity and mortality and differential access to treatment and care.

The 0-6 child sex ratio has continued to decline from 927 to 914 as per the provisional results of Census 2011. It is amy evident that this is due to the spread of this decline to states and regions which had no prior history of adverse sex ratios, such as north-west India. Rather it is now rampant in central India, eastern regions, and even in states like Andhra Pradesh. The government would need to think about its policies in the light of this disturbing trend.

Differentials in morbidity and mortality and differential access to treatment and care for women are a cause for concern. Juxtaposed against the high communicable and non communicable disease burden, are the low public sector provisions for health and unfilled commitments regarding providing access to care. Disparities in access and quality of health care services are linked to both spatial location and ability to pay. Public expenditure on health care in India is among the lowest in the world, both as a proportion of total expenditure on health care and as a percentage of GDP. Government expenditure on health care in India constitutes only 19.67 per cent of total expenditure while 71.13 per cent is spent by households themselves. In contrast, Government expenditure on health care is 87 per cent of total health related expenditure in UK, 80 per cent in France, 64 per cent in Thailand and 46 per cent in Sri Lanka. Clearly, public expenditure on health care in India is among the lowest in the world. The budget for health has to increase significantly for delivery of equitable health care of a high quality. The Eleventh Plan fell severely short of raising the share of public expenditure on Health from less than 1 per cent of GDP in 2006-07 to 2-3 per cent of GDP as the likely achievement will be only 1.4 per cent of GDP. While it is suggested that total health expenditure be increased to 2.5 per cent of GDP by the end of the Twelfth Plan, no explanations are provided regarding the basis for determining the adequacy of this or the roadmap for achieving it.

There is need for recognizing the critical care work provided by women, that saves the public health system both time and cost. The responsibility of care-giving within the home lies with women. It needs to be recognized and support provided to alleviate some of the difficulties, drudgery and depression that surround this role. The burden on home-based care givers must be reduced by strengthening primary health centres and public hospitals, community care homes and hospices. The government would need to think about its policies in the light of this disturbing trend.

The massive extent of the communicable and non-communicable disease burden is reflected in Ministry of Health & Family Welfare (MoHFW) data. Nearly two million or one-fifth of the 9.2 million cases of TB that occur in the world every year are in India, more than 1.5 million persons are infected with Malaria every year (almost half of them suffer from *p.falciparum* malaria); one-third of global cases infected with filaria live in India; nearly half of leprosy cases detected in the world in 2008 were contributed by India; more than 300 million episodes of acute diarrhoea occur every year in India in children below 5 years of age. Addressing the challenge of ill health requires, among other things, availability of qualified doctors, diagnostic and treatment facilities. Access to health care must be based on population norms for Primary Health Centres (PHCs), Community Health Centres (CHCs) and medical personnel.

A study based on data collected from 1.920 households in 60 villages in two sub-districts of Koppal (in North Karnataka), found that ‘the more insecure the household’s economic status, the greater the chance that health-seeking will be rationed within the household, and this is borne disproportionately by girls and women. 25
and men do not receive the same care, even for the same conditions. Women are often only brought in at advanced stages because of the rising costs of medical care. Access to health care cannot fail to secure adequate medical care because of the inability to pay. Access to health care cannot depend on the vagaries of public-private or non-working members of the family; increase in debt; etc. The gaps between needs and outcomes can be bridged by re-prioritising expenditure to universalize access to treatment and drugs for those who need it; accurate information regarding symptoms; opportunistic illness; exposure, prevention, medication and adherence; access to diagnostics, pre and post test counselling, medical care, effective drugs through revised schedules and continuity of access; planning of adequate doctors, nurses and medical staff as per norms; and functional equipment and ambulances to link PHCs to Hospitals. Plans must be put in place to meet needs of victims of domestic violence.

Crisis centres should be located in government hospitals and hospital staff should be sensitized to recognise and provide support for victims of domestic violence. The Dilasa model can be replicated. Adequate resources must be provided against agreed budget heads so that the Act is implemented properly. While the middle and upper middle classes can choose to use either the public or the private health care system, the poor may not be in a position to access either of them because of the rising costs of medical care. When public facility is weak, this will clearly affect utilization by the poorer sections of the population. Insurance requires money and paper work that create access barriers for the poor and difficulties in getting reimbursement of expenditure that has been incurred.

In the absence of adequate health facilities in rural areas there is heavy dependence of rural people on quacks or unqualified practitioners for treatment. The state of medical practitioners is that of 487 cases of various illnesses among the women in the sample, 39 per cent had gone untreated, and 30 per cent had been treated either by self or by what they described as quacks. The rest had some professional treatment but it is not known at what stage. This pattern is partly because rural women find it difficult to reach the professionals who in many instances are rarely on duty when they should be. Or, they are located too far away for women to go there. As an added challenge, there is also an urgent need to regulate quacks.

If the decentralized public health services in the country are to improve significantly, there is a need for injecting substantial resources into the health sector and it requires priority and continued support of the government. Shortfalls in essential infrastructure, nurses, doctors, and other staff and drugs must be corrected; and access to PHCs, CHCs and medical care provided based on diagnosis, treatment and follow-up. While the individual should fail to secure adequate medical care because of the inability to pay. Access to health care cannot depend on the vagaries of public-private or public-donor partnerships. The state must take responsibility for access to quality health care (preventive, promotive and curative) for all, with special responsibility for vulnerable groups. However, the justice variable cannot be determined by ownership of a BPL card, since this will lead to errors of exclusion.

Rural Transformation

The development programmes that are supporting the rural transformation process by improving rural infrastructure and supporting livelihoods, both on-farm and off-farm are intended to ‘include’ the excluded. Some of the major flagship programmes operating in rural areas are Mahatma Gandhi National Rural Employment Guarantee Act (MNREGA), National Rural Livelihood Mission (NRLM), Indira Awas Yojana (IAY), National Rural Drinking Water Programme (NRDWP), Total Sanitation Campaign (TSC), Integrated Watershed Development Programme (IWDP), Pradhan Mantri Gramin Aajivikya Yojana (PMGKY) and Rajiv Gandhi Grameen Vridhyanukar Yojana (RRGGVY).

While in the Approach Paper, it is argued that impressive achievements have been made in these programmes, it is also admitted that they can only contribute at the margin and bulk of the income improvement for this section of the population must come from a substantial improvement in land productivity and rising incomes that would provide even for landless labour. It is noted that the performance of these programmes can be greatly improved through design improvement and incorporation of greater flexibility. Each such scheme should have a small proportion of the funds set aside as ‘flexi-fund’ to promote innovation and allow state specific flexibility reflecting the varying conditions across the country.

These are honest admissions with some useful suggestions but there are a few glaring omissions / commissions which impact on women directly and indirectly:

- It is well known that large numbers of women access these schemes, some of which have a gender component built in. However, while assessing the achievements, except for MNREGA, where the proportion of women who have participated in the programme is given, women are ‘invisibilised’ in the others, whether housing, or SHGs or pensions.
- It is stated that ‘The IAY programme has not provided houses to 22.5 million BPL households while more than 3.5 million SHGs have been formed under Swarnajayant Gram Swarozgar Yojana (SGSY). The coverage under the National Rural Livelihood Mission (NRLM) which provided a pension for BPL population over the age of 65 had increased to 21.6 million beneficiaries by 2009-10’ (the age of eligibility has been lowered to 60 years). However, no gender disaggregated breakup of these numbers is provided. This makes it difficult to assess how well the gender concerns in the guidelines are working. For instance under the IAY the house allotment should be in the name of the male member of the family as a first priority. How has that worked out in practice? How many of the 22.5 million houses are in the name of a woman? If the number is too low, does the guideline need to be changed? Again, ageing has a gender dimension, that is, there is an increasing proportion of women in the older population, which is well-known and is a worldwide phenomenon, one of the reasons being that women live longer than men. Even in India, where males outnumber females in total population, the proportion of women (60+) is 1030 females per 1000 males as per the Census of India, 2001. With the incidence of women in the older age groups being higher, the numbers of older women (60+) as also elderly, weighing old age pension women is higher. The question is how many of the above women should be entitled to the above entitlement? How many of the above women are entitled to the above entitlement?”
instead of a separate scheme for women farmers, the incentives applied and commercially applicable output directed development strategy”, would further this, and in fact the strategy it suggests, “paradigm already recognised, and the Chinese government is development consequences, as indeed China has the recent past. This imbalance can have serious which has been growing rather than reducing in

The neglect of basic research is a fundamental
Research & Development (R&D), and making public incentives to the private sector to provide for more
farmers have not been included.

Instead of a separate scheme for women farmers, the proposed Mahila Kisan Sashaktikaran Pariyojana (MKSP) is conceived as a subcomponent of NRLM, which is likely to relegate them into another ghetto of exclusion. Why not mandate all schemes for farmers to incorporate a specific quota for women, for example, the Rashtriya Krishi Vikas Yojana (RKVY), and to provide reasons, and to have to explain if a certain proportion of women farmers have not been included.

Science, Technology and Innovations

The neglect of basic research is a fundamental problem in Indian Science & Technology (S&T), which has been growing rather than reducing in the recent past. This imbalance can have serious development consequences, as indeed China has already recognised, and the Chinese government is already moving to correct this.

But, the Approach Paper shows no recognition of this, and in fact the strategy it suggests, “paradigm shift from the current input driven model to an output directed delivery strategy” would further incentivize applied and commercially applicable scientific research rather than basic research. Significant emphasis is placed on providing greater incentives to the private sector to provide for more Research & Development (R&D), and making public R&D more commercially oriented.

There are several problems with this approach. It does not generate more investment in socially relevant technologies that may not appear to be financially profitable. A significant part of the technologies associated with women’s unpaid work fall into this category. Similarly, research to develop technologies that help to improve labour safety and labor productivity in micro and small enterprises (where women workers are concentrated) would also be ignored.

There are strong possibilities of conflict of interest in corporate-funded research, especially when there are no checks and balances, in terms of public research that can test the claims and plausibility of declared new privately sponsored technologies. This has huge implications for women in diverse ways, in medical and biotechnology research, in agricultural research and so on. The Approach Paper does not specify any regulatory changes that would prevent this, but in any case, as has been noted, regulation is inadequate in the absence of alternative disinterested publicly funded research.

The chapter on Innovations is interesting for the innovative way it has outlined its approach to the theme of what it refers to as the “emerging Indian approach to innovations”. Firstly, it seeks to focus on finding affordable solutions for the needs of people – for health, water, transport, etc. – without compromising quality. Secondly, desired outcomes are to be produced by innovations in organizational and process models that deliver to people the benefits of technologies developed in laboratories. Thirdly, innovations are envisaged to take place in the process of innovation itself, to reduce the cost of developing the innovations.

It may be noted that given the gendered nature of organization of work, particularly in the household, and given the significance of public transport for the poor and poor women in particular, investment in innovations needs to be prioritized to address issues of drudgery, sanitation, and energy for cooking and heating.

In fact we would even go further and say that the Central Government should universally resolve issues of drudgery, sanitation and energy through appropriate and sufficient investments by end of the Twelfth Plan. The practice of viewing water, sanitation, fuel, etc., solely as women’s problems needs to be opposed. The persistence of deficits in basic needs/infrastructure is a huge deprivation and needs to be addressed as such.

Needless to state, prioritizing the above areas has to be appropriately backed by not only adequate finances, but also appropriate institutions, systems of accountability and monitoring, so that the goal of universal coverage in these areas is achieved by end of the Twelfth Plan. The chapter on Innovations glosses over the controversy generated by the Aadhaar (UID) programme of the government in suggesting that the latter could become the foundation for more transparent and efficient public service delivery. Provision of basic services, infrastructure has to be universal and so linking any of these services to UID is not acceptable. Secondly, bringing in targeting through the backdoor will once again defeat any chance that we may have of demanding universalization of such basic necessities of life and living. Lastly, whatever the quantum of funds required for realization of universalization needs to be provided so that we avoid the present scenario of these services being provided as largesse.

Sustainable Management of Natural Resources

A perceptive understanding of the gender dimensions of natural resource management and the inextricable linkages between the two, is pivotal to any successful strategy on Natural Resource Management. Women manage natural resources daily in their various roles and therefore their participation is important not only from the viewpoint of equity, but also important from the perspective of efficiency and effectiveness. The Approach Paper underscores the ‘constraints of limitations of natural resources against the backdrop of a rapidly growing economy and the pertinent need to exploit these in a sustainable manner’, however, what is fails to capture is the important dimension of women’s participation necessary to ensure a sustainable approach. Some important concerns in this regard are:

Water Resources Management

Women’s productive and reproductive roles thrust upon them the burden of water collection, for which they may have to traverse long distances on foot. The lack of water and sanitation facilities significantly and disproportionately impacts the lives of women and girls as compared to that of men and boys.

Although water for drinking and sanitation comprises only a small portion of the overall water requirement in rural areas, water management practices and policies need to be reviewed in the light of the increasing need for irrigation and secure drinking water, universally available in rural India (the Approach Paper recognizes the last). Therefore, women must be recognized as primary stakeholders in water resources management and have a primary role at the core of community-based water governance.

Women, water and work are deeply linked and their combination can effectively fight poverty, as women use water for both domestic and economic purposes. Women can be integrated in water management through construction of roof rainwater harvesting structures; construction of plastic-lined ponds; operation and maintenance of rural piped water supply schemes; repair and maintenance of hand-pumps; revival of traditional sources of drinking water; and installation of pulley systems in surface wells.

Land

The Approach Paper states, ‘rapid growth is only possible if some land which is currently used for agricultural purposes, or degraded forest land can be made available for building much needed infrastructure, establishing new industrial units, undertaking mining and accommodating the inevitable expansion of urban settlements’. This is highly misplaced and contrary to the claim of an inclusive and sustainable approach.

Significant is the case of land issues in tribal belts, displacement and the gendered impact. Women are displaced not only from their land but they are also dislocated from their traditional farm production and household economy.

The loss of access to forests and the resources “results in the emergence of an unemployed and unemployable ‘housewife’ who is increasingly not only perceived to be but becomes almost solely dependent on her husband. Additionally, access to resources in the post-displacement scenario is almost always mediated via husbands, who now assume the role of ‘sole’ bread earners.”

There is no mention of process of completion of land reforms, land inequalities, redistribution in context of feminisation of agriculture. There is also no mention of the change in land relations with reference to reverse tenancy, contract farming etc.

With respect to land use strategies, the entire focus of the Approach Paper is on land that is to be used for industry and urban growth and how well the paperwork is done to use the land. This is highlighted as the essential concern for the National Land Management Strategy. The Approach Paper states, 'State Governments should aim at developing land clusters for industry, taking into account the needs of specific industries so that industries that are synergistic can come up in one cluster with appropriate infrastructure (like auto, pharmaceutical, leather, textile clusters)'.

The land acquisition drive (for industry, mining, infrastructure) projected for future development, will have a huge impact on the poor – both rural and urban. Women will significantly be affected for two important reasons – firstly, the dispossession and displacement will impact women’s food security and economy (livelihood) as they will be displaced from the source of daily subsistence (food and labour wages etc.); and secondly, most women do not own the title to the land for obvious reasons. This will leave women without any livelihood options (as they depend on the land for their livelihood) as well as no control on the money acquired through the sale.

Food Security

On food security, the Approach Paper mentions that “the issue of food security is perhaps the easiest part of the Plan, as the will be replaced from the source of daily subsistence (food and labour wages etc.) and additionally development of Special Economic Zones (SEZ)”.

i. As per the report of the Sub-group on land related issues, Planning Commission (2007), the gradual decline in the Net Sown Area (NSA) of approximately 2 million hectares. However, it must be kept in mind that this is only 0.6 percent of the total net sown area”. This statement has two inherent contradictions:

(a) Recognising the contributions and changes

As in any democracy, in India too, the claims and needs of the vocal and the powerful tend to get a priority over those of the weak and the voiceless. Unprecedented development and the economic boom in recent years have created a multiplier effect on the developmental activities such as creation of infrastructure like roads, ports, airports, housing etc. and additionally development of Special Economic Zones (SEZ)26.

ii. Issues of food security are not contingent, only on increase in agriculture production and output. It is about increasing per capita access to food by strengthening and universalising the well intended distribution system (PDS) and the implementation of Indian Food Security Act27, which aims to improve food access for the country’s poorest communities.

Managing the Environment

Community Involvement in Forest Management: Women are the chief repository of knowledge concerning the use and management of forests. Therefore, women should be given a major role in the management and conservation of forest resources. It is equally important to ensure that this role is not limited to only that of token representation, as has been pointed out in many studies.

Community Rights and Minor Forest Produce: It is unfortunate that the Approach Paper to the Twelfth Plan, while acknowledging that what “the primary tribal collectors of NTFPs (Non-Timber Forest Products) get today is a very small fraction of the potential benefits embedded in NTFPs”, concludes that providing a high price for forest produce will not be in the interest of legal tracers, who would be forced to pay a higher price to the gatherers. The Planning Commission seems to be advocating the interests of tracers, as opposed to those of the poor gatherers who are often women28. It is equally important that there should be a price-based aggressive buying of NTFPs by state agencies, as has been done for wheat and rice.

Women are contracted by the forest staff or other civilian contractors for casual labor such as transplanting, nursery, leaf collection etc. This work is on daily wage rate or piece rate basis. Women are preferred here, as they are given much lower wages than men29.

Energy Sector

Women of poor households contribute in many ways to the welfare of their households and usually do so at great cost to themselves, for which they get little acknowledgement or compensation, whether from their families or from society. One major service done by most rural Indian women for their families, as well as for the country, is to provide for the daily energy needs of the vast majority of households; they do so by collecting non-commercial materials and processing these into fuel for cooking.

The focus of planning for the Energy Sector is the achievement of growth in commercial energy supply of 6.5 and 7 percent per year so that rapid GDP growth is not jeopardised. The method suggested for efficiency is, rationalization of energy prices to incentivise energy efficiency and non-price initiatives to push the economy towards greater energy efficiency. Missing in this is ‘inclusion’ or the importance of making an effort, an effort to meet the everyday needs of poor women, either in the context of reducing the drudgery associated with collecting firewood or preventing the pollution and health hazards associated with using them for cooking their food. Also missing is the importance of meeting the energy required by small and marginal farms and micro-enterprises that enable the survival of a large majority of men and women as well as contribute to GDP.

The focus is on ensuring that energy requirements of the major contributors to the GDP - industry, transport, agriculture, etc. - are met so that these sectors do not constrain achievement of the 9 per cent per year growth. In achieving these goals, the objective is to keep a check on the import bill for fossil fuels through increased energy efficiency of these (mainly imported) fuels and thus reduce the energy elasticity of various activities. It also seeks to achieve growth in production while controlling carbon emissions from energy producing activities.

Despite RGGVY, a large number of habitations are still uncovered and a very large population has no connectivity. While there is recognition of the need for universalization of access to power, it is crucial that there should be a commitment that this will be achieved during the Twelfth Plan and a roadmap provided on how this objective will be attained. There is a tremendous potential of the use of alternate energy that is of vital concern to the majority of Indian women, especially rural women, i.e., fuel for cooking meals consumed by men, women and children each day.

(c) Recognising the contributions and changes of the voiceless

As in any democracy, in India too, the claims and needs of the vocal and the powerful tend to get a priority over those of the weak and the voiceless. Women are contracted by the forest staff or other civilian contractors for casual labor such as transplanting, nursery, leaf collection etc. This work is on daily wage rate or piece rate basis. Women are preferred here, as they are given much lower wages than men.

Despite RGGVY, a large number of habitations are still uncovered and a very large population has no connectivity. While there is recognition of the need for universalization of access to power, it is crucial that there should be a commitment that this will be achieved during the Twelfth Plan and a roadmap provided on how this objective will be attained. There is a tremendous potential of the use of alternate energy that is of vital concern to the majority of Indian women, especially rural women, i.e., fuel for cooking meals consumed by men, women and children each day.

The term is used in the Integrated Energy Policy, 2011.20

30The Indian Food Security bill hopes to empower women by ensuring that women are the ones receive and manage the food distribution or cash transfers


32Gera, 2002

33The term is used in the Integrated Energy Policy, 2011.

34Report based on a survey conducted by Dr Nirmala Banerji

35Report is based on a survey conducted by Dr Nirmala Banerji

36The NSSO report on Household Consumption Expenditure (66th Round 2009-10) shows that 87 percent of rural households and 25.1 percent of urban households use firewood and wood chips, while 41 percent of rural and 7.8 percent of urban households use dung cakes. The numbers involved are therefore very large, of the order of more than 100 million women dealing with these fuels each day.

The findings of a survey25 regarding the use of fuel by over 300 rural households and the work and hazards involved in that show that not more than 1 percent of households used any commercial fuel. All were using any combustible material they could find - leaves, sticks, agricultural waste, wood, or dung. But with a high degree of landlessness and little availability of common land, most women had to search long and hard to get enough materials for their daily use.

The collected materials need further processing and even then emit large quantities of smoke during cooking. The average daily time taken to collect and
process fuel materials varied between an hour and a half to over three hours and on the whole, those with little or no land had to put in longer hours than those with some land. In addition, for the major part of the cooking time, the cook as well as children and old people, who were likely to be home during the couple of hours of cooking, are also subjected to the smoke. Apart from common complaints like eye irritation, cough, headaches etc., the Health Department of the West Bengal Government has shown that, respiratory diseases are the single largest killer in the State and in rural areas; much of the air pollution comes from inefficiently burnt fuel materials.

This is corroborated by a study of 792 households with some land. In addition, for the major part of the cooking time, the cook as well as children and old people, who were likely to be home during the couple of hours of cooking, are also subjected to the smoke. Apart from common complaints like eye irritation, cough, headaches etc., the Health Department of the West Bengal Government has shown that, respiratory diseases are the single largest killer in the State and in rural areas; much of the air pollution comes from inefficiently burnt fuel materials.

The significant impact of using firewood, wood chips, dung-cakes, grass etc. on the health and survival of young and old women who live in poverty stricken households is listed in the Table 1 below. Additionally, in hilly terrain the slopes, from which women collect biomass, are slippery and accidents, fractures and bruises are frequent. These are privately incurred costs of drudgery, pain, expenditure and loss of work days that must be built into any estimates of cost/ viability of clean energy provisioning.

Table 1: Health effects of biomass fuel use in cooking

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Processes</th>
<th>Potential Health Hazards</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Production</td>
<td>Faecal/ oral/ enteric infections</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Skin infections</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Charcoal production</td>
<td>CO/Smoke poisoning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Burns/trauma</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Cataract</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Collection</td>
<td>Trauma</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Reduced infant/child care</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Bites from venomous reptiles/insects</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Allergic reactions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Fungus infections</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Severe fatigue</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Muscular pain/back pain/arthritis</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Combustion</td>
<td>Conjunctivitis</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Blepharo conjunctivitis</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Upper respiratory irritation / inflammatory</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Acute respiratory infection (ARI)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Effects of smoke</td>
<td>Acute poisoning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Effects of toxic gases (CO)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Effects of chronic smoke inhalation</td>
<td>Chronic obstructive pulmonary disease (COPD)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Chronic bronchitis</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Cor pulmonale</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Asthma reproductive outcomes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Cancer (lung)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Effects of heat</td>
<td>Burns</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Cataract</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ergonomic effects of crouching over stove</td>
<td>Arthritis</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Effects of location of stove on floor</td>
<td>Burns in infants/toddlers/children</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The other consideration regarding energy use is about keeping down carbon emissions. Major contributors to carbon emissions are production of electricity, transport etc.15. Compared to these, domestic combustion of non-commercial fuels generates very little carbon emissions. For example, electricity generation gives out 719.31 million tons of carbon emissions while domestic combustion of fuel wood and waste only generates about 75 million tons of Co2-2q-emissions. Since the replacement of these by LPG is expected to generate even more Co2-2q-emissions, the planners are not very concerned about the current practices of using any kind of biomass for cooking. However, it needs to be stressed that in leaving out of consideration these non-commercial domestic fuels and their users, the planners are guilty of neglecting the daily hard labour and health hazards run by a very large section of rural women in all parts of India.

In saying that, “the Twelfth Plan must envisage convergence between livelihoods, availability and access to food, eco systems and human health”, the Approach Paper has set for the plan a broad goal. To fit into this vision, plans for energy cannot focus merely on current users of commercial fuels; they must also include plans for alleviating the daily chores faced by millions of women who so far have deployed their manual labour every day and sacrificed their health and have thereby cut down on the country’s requirements of imported fuels. Biomass is a fuel that is widely available and women do not have a choice but to continue using it. But the state cannot accept this situation as given. It is essential that government allocates some resources for immediately finding ways of using these materials in more efficient ways. What is needed is local enterprises that commercially collect the materials and process them into a form that minimises smoke emissions. If the technical inputs and training required are widely publicised and made readily available by the state machinery along with some initial financial help, this could also be a way of generating manufacturing employment especially for women in rural areas. The Twelfth Plan must take cognisance of the health hazards and privately and publicly incurred costs due to ill-health caused by the use of poorly designed traditional chulhas and fuel-efficient improved cook-stoves be made accessible to rural women on priority.

Urban Sector

India’s urban population has increased from 285 million in 2001 to almost 400 million in 2011. The Approach Paper states that by 2030, out of a total projected population of 1.4 billion, over 600 million people may be living in urban areas. The Paper asserts that the process of urbanization is a natural process associated with growth and that agglomeration and densification of economic activities (and habitations) in urban conglomerations stimulates economic efficiencies and provides more opportunities for entrepreneurship and employment and “this enables faster inclusion of more people in the growth process and is therefore more inclusive.” However, while urban growth may create livelihood opportunities, this will not automatically get translated into “inclusion”. Much of the growth that is created is casual and the wages paid are irregular and exploitative. In view of this, the following issues need attention.

Migration from rural to urban areas occurs due to push and pull factors - lack of livelihood opportunities in villages push people to urban areas and potential livelihood opportunities in urban areas act as magnets. High population density and lack of affordable spaces in cities and towns lead to the growing ‘informalization’ of the formal sector, with informal workers has increased is because of the growing informalization of the formal sector, with 34 per cent of the formal enterprises employing informal workers in the form of contract workers or casual labour. Among the self employed, most of the workers would be in a “vulnerable” category, being either own account workers such as street vendors or family helpers. The better-off, employer or family helpers. The better-off, employer

Informal employment is higher for women than for men. 85 per cent of all women workers are informally employed as compared to 79 per cent of all male workers. One reason why the number of informal workers has increased is because of the growing “informalization” of the formal sector, with the main areas of work are home-based work and domestic work. More than 16 per cent of the women were hired by households as domestic workers – double the percentage in 1999-2000; whereas over 38 per cent of women were home-based workers, a category of work that has grown substantially in 2009-10.
Informal workers are vulnerable for the following reasons. First, the number of days of work is uncertain. Second, the work itself is uncertain and often short of what is expected. Third, their earnings are low in comparison with their expenditures and fourth, there is a lack of social security or safety net measures to compensate for employment risks.

A study conducted by SEWA in 5 different urban areas, two big and two small, found that the days of work available varied considerably. For street vendors it varied from 58 days in Ahmadabad to 47 days in Bikaner to 20 days in Delhi. Construction workers, on the other hand, in big cities of Delhi and Ahmadabad, got barely 15 days work, whereas in the smaller towns they were working for 25 days in the month. A major problem for most urban workers is the uncertainty and insecurity of work. The uncertainty of market conditions is of course responsible for this insecurity. In the formal sector, workers are protected to some extent from market uncertainties with most of the risk being borne by the enterprises. Informally employed workers bear all the market risks, which increase their vulnerability further. Low earnings of the urban workers lead to vulnerability. The SEWA study showed that the earnings of street vendors vary from around Rs.200 in the bigger cities to about Rs.70 in small ones. The earnings of home-based workers, especially females, are abysmally low and range from Rs.15 to Rs.70 per day.

Informal sector workers lack social security. Perhaps the most widespread security they have is the Public Distribution System (PDS), which ensures a minimum level of food security. However, as many studies have shown, corruption and leakages exist in the PDS. The Rashtriya Swasthya Bima Yojana (RSBY) is another scheme meant for unorganised workers, which is as yet confined to BPL (Rajiv Awas Yojana) is another scheme meant for unorganised workers, which is as yet confined to BPL (Rajiv Awas Yojana) is another scheme meant for unorganised workers, which is as yet confined to BPL.

In the context of urbanization, urban renewal and de-industrialization of cities, urban livelihoods are impacted by municipal policies, regulations, and practices – more so than national policies. Urban livelihoods have been overlooked or undermined by municipalities and urban planners, and are also excluded from and eroded by urban renewal schemes. Urban informal groups face threats to their livelihoods everyday - as street vendors often have to pay bribes to the police or municipal authority and live in fear of being evicted. Among these groups, women street vendors face higher levels of vulnerability due to the additional risk of sexual harassment. Home-based producers, mostly women, lack basic infrastructure and services and face single-use zoning regulations. Similarly, waste pickers are excluded from the solid waste management system of government and where privatized, of the private company. Again single zone that industries are driven out of cities where workers live.

What is needed is fair city planning. This requires:

• Increased focus in city planning on the livelihoods of the poor.
• Fair allocation of urban land/space and other resources to the livelihoods of the poor.
• Fair resettlement schemes and measures.
• More specifically, for home-based workers – appropriate zoning regulations that allow commercial activities by residents in residential areas; for street vendors - increased allocation and improved management of vending spaces in central business districts; acceptance of the principle of natural markets; and for waste pickers - increased or improved integration into municipal waste management.

While a large number of people living in slums are deprived of urban basic services, a substantial proportion of people do not even have access to shelter. The homeless and especially the women among this group are the most vulnerable group in urban areas. Interviews conducted with 93 respondents show that many of those who are homeless, sleep in courtyards or places of worship, pavements and road sides, railway platforms and market corridors. They work primarily as casual daily wage labour. Many survive on charity.

Unemployment rates in urban areas have increased for females in all the three categories of Usual, Weekly and Daily status while unemployment rates for males could only increase in the Daily status category. Hence, the employment scenario for females has led to the phenomenon of feminization of urban poverty. The impact on women is higher due to poverty combined with existing gender discrimination.40

The Approach Paper discusses the urban agenda in three parts: desired inputs, expected outputs/outcomes and instrument of policy/funding intervention. Issues in the context of each of these are raised below.

In the context of desired inputs, it refers to improving the process of urbanization through spatially wider urban planning and development of regions. In this context, there are disparities in access to housing of those with and without skills and assets. People, whether rich or poor, come to the urban area and continue to live there for a number of reasons, the foremost being the ability to earn better livelihood. While the educated who own assets are able to get a job in the formal economy and reasonable accommodation, those who are poor, unskilled and lack assets are at best able to find work in the informal economy and live in informal settlements. These informal settlements lack basic infrastructure. The threat of demolition of these structures leads to constant insecurity. In spite of difficulties, they work towards improving basic infrastructure and housing, incrementally, from kuccha to pucca.

Tenure or property rights are not binary - either you have it or you don’t. In fact, the reality is that there are stages of ‘formalization’ ranging from ‘no-eviction’ clauses, to limited tenure leases, to longer term leases, to RPSBY, municipal schemes, etc. On private lands, the situation is more complicated, like for instance, the inhabitants have ‘bought’ the land/ house but the agreement is not registered, leaving the actual ownership in limbo.

Between the formal housing and slums, there could be different kinds of settlements, which are recognized by the city. These settlements will have basic infrastructure and pucca house, both built incrementally. There is a need to create special by-laws for houses upgraded in-situ, instead of adhering to by-laws intended for middle/ high income housing.

With regard to the need to strengthen infrastructure, it is important to note that for women perhaps the most important possession is a home as this provides her physical security as well as the opportunity to protect, nurture and raise her children. In this respect, the city also her workplace. Unfortunately, for most urban women, especially the poor, homes have insecure tenure, are illegal or unauthorized or encroached. Further due to patriarchal structures most homes are not owned by women.

Indian cities are perhaps some of the dirtiest cities in the world, as sanitation and solid waste management is usually low on policy makers’ priorities. There is a strong gender dimension to safe water and sanitation. For an urban woman, the lack of a toilet is a major problem. It affects women’s and girls’ health, physical security and exposure to violence. Sanitation significantly improves health and nutrition outcomes especially of women and girls. Lack of urban sewerage is a major problem – the vast majority of cities and towns do not have even a partial sewerage network. Water and sanitation are basic needs and should be delinked from issues of tenure and ownership of an APL/ BPL card. These needs must find a place in the plans for the nation.

Although governments acknowledge the need for urbanization, too many of them confuse the issue. In fact, most ULBs do not prevent this universalization by denying facilities to habitats which are not fully “authorized”, with policies which deny facilities. Instead, ULBs should provide minimum levels of safe drinking and household-use water, a clean toilet, sewerage, storm water drainage and solid waste management, to all of the urban population in order to ensure clean and hygienic urban areas. Provisioning of basic water and sanitation should be de-linked from the issues of land tenure. Every urban dweller should be provided with minimum levels of safe water and sanitation, irrespective of the legal status of the land on which he/she is dwelling or possession of identity proof or status of migration. This service should be extended to recent and temporary/ seasonal migrants too and on private as well as centre/ state owned lands. Provision of basic services does not entitle the dweller to any legal rights to the land on which he/ she is residing.

Rajiv Awas Yojana is mentioned in the section on Expected Outputs/Outcomes in the Paper, and it should be mandatory for the housing provided to be registered jointly in the names of both husband and wife. The section on Instruments for Intervention includes issues of governance. Urban governance

40Mander, 2009.
40Rustagi, Sarkar and Joddar, 2009.
remains top-heavy and does not reach down to the mohalla/ local level. Women, remain particularly voiceless within urban governance, and poor women, especially so. It is important to include the voice of women in urban governance. Local voices can only be brought into governance through a process of consolidation at local levels. This can be done through formation and recognition of Community Based Organizations (CBOs) at the local level. The Local Welfare Association is one such powerful local organization. The process of creation of CBOs in each settlement and its accreditation by the ULBs should be encouraged. These CBOs should be brought together into an association or a federation and become an active participant and stakeholder in urban processes. The CBO should be recognized regardless of the legality or authorization of the existing settlement. The local CBOs which are formed should have a representation of 50 per cent women and should preferably be headed by a woman.

**Governance**

The Approach Paper harbours much faith in institutional reforms. How will this be done and who will do them? Governance would include institutional arrangements, managerial capabilities, legal and political framework of governance as well as rational convergence of development delivery. While there is a general understanding that there are impediments to the effective delivery of policies and programmes such as the ‘silo’ system (i.e., Central Ministerial control over the schemes), and a focus on professional managerial skills, there is no reference to the importance of the Panchayati Raj Institutions (PRIs) as well as the Municipalities or their role in providing that convergence.

The Working Group on Panchayati Raj set up by the Planning Commission has drawn attention to four critical gaps:

i. programmes and schemes are often designed without adequate understanding of the desires and limitations of the beneficiaries, especially the most disadvantaged;

ii. systems for informing the people of their rights and entitlements are very poor and often exclusionary;

iii. the service delivery personnel, apart from issues of corruption, are inadequately informed of their duties and responsibilities and take little pride in their work; and

iv. complaint redressal systems are not independent of the delivery mechanism resulting in non-responsive behaviour.

In recent years, several developments have taken place that can help to remove the various biases that are still very much a part of our governance machine. One of them is the machinery set in motion to decentralize governance authority through panchayats, district councils and municipal bodies; with reservation of seats for various disadvantaged groups including women in them, there is hope that plans and policies executed by them would aim to correct inequities in the system. However, planners are yet to devise sufficient powers to these bodies to make any impact. Too much authority is still centralised at the top and central schemes decide on the one design for programmes that are to be applied everywhere. This has foiled any hope of giving women a voice in future development plans.

The role of governance, in particular local governance, in which women can play an active role in developmental planning, given their political presence (now over 50 per cent), is critical in this convergence. Women’s participation as elected representatives in local bodies (evolved over the past 15 years) has brought, last minute, the strengthening of these agencies’ roles and powers, especially for implementing the ‘inclusive’ programmes at the grassroots level would be enabling for women led governance factored in. Needing to state, it is the combined effect of these inclusive programmes that can ameliorate much of the rural deprivation, in particular for women who perform some of these tasks in the unpaid ‘care economy’.

With the district now being identified as the first building block for planning, and devolution of untied funds and flagship schemes to district levels; a district plan which includes gendered analysis of the district’s economy, postulates a goal of food and livelihood security and allocates funds accordingly, is crucial. In short, governance should mean that with political democracy women are enabled to build economic democracy.

The Approach Paper acknowledged the importance of ‘evaluation’. However, for evaluation to be effective, capacity of evaluators, openness of implementing agencies, as well as the ability of the commissioners of evaluation to use evaluation findings, all need to be strengthened. There is an important role here for feminist/ gender sensitive evaluation. It is important to acknowledge and encourage different methods of evaluation; and feminist and participatory, mixed method evaluations can play a very important role in shaping programmes to be more inclusive and gender sensitive, and also offer a way of bringing the findings of feminist research to bear on policy formulation in an on-going manner.

**Social and Regional Equity**

It is important to acknowledge that despite efforts to be inclusive within the framework of faster growth, there are concerns whether historically disadvantaged groups and also whether some regions are still neglected. It is extremely critical that the Twelfth Plan proactively address these concerns.

Unfortunately, barring fleeting references to specific groups of women (widows, girl children, sex workers and women headed households), ‘women’ are almost completely missing from this chapter on Social and Regional equity. It is ironical that an Approach Paper which aspires for ‘faster and ‘more’ inclusive growth’ is completely silent on the historical disadvantage that women have faced in patriarchal societies such as ours, nor is there any mention of the need to incorporate the gender lens into policy planning and budgeting.

While the Eleventh Plan recognized that women are not a homogenous group, the Approach Paper to the Twelfth Plan makes no such mention. It is critical that women are considered in each disadvantaged group. One of them is the machinery set in motion under the Panchayati Raj Institutions (PRIs) as well as the Municipalities or their role in providing that convergence.

There is a need to review the methodology of the GBS and to monitor the GBS. A more robust and analytical format, will facilitate ministries to reflect on the findings, all need to be strengthened. There is an important role here for feminist/ gender sensitive evaluation. It is important to acknowledge and encourage different methods of evaluation; and feminist and participatory, mixed method evaluations can play a very important role in shaping programmes to be more inclusive and gender sensitive, and also offer a way of bringing the findings of feminist research to bear on policy formulation in an on-going manner.

**Gender Responsive Budgeting (GRB)**

Women’s Empowerment (WE) is missing. GRB is an important strategy to ensure that there is adequate public provisioning for GEWE. Although, the Indian government’s experience of GRB is widely used as reference point for other GRB initiatives, there seems to be an underestimation of the regional disparity that has been achieved under the rubric of GRB. Despite several attempts at refinement and restructuring to ensure accurate reporting, the Gender Budget Statement (GBS) remains fraught with huge methodological errors/fluors.

One of the biggest concerns is the low public provisioning for GEWE - both at the aggregate level as well as at the level of unit costs. Not only do several policies and schemes meant to benefit women fall short at the aggregate level, but also equally so from unrealistically low unit costs. The severity of this problem becomes manifest when we look at the low wages and the poor service conditions of frontline service providers, women in public sector employment. Several Centrally Sponsored Schemes (CSS) like the Integrated Child Development Services (ICDS) and National Rural Health Mission (NRHM) aimed at providing nutrition, health and education, employ women as the frontline service providers. In all these programmes, women are the primary link between the government and the community. Anganwadi Workers and Helpers under ICDS, ASHAs under NRHM and cooks-cum-helpers under Mid Day Meal Scheme (MDMS) are required to perform multiple roles and sometimes assigned additional duties over and above their existing work burden.

This increasing reliance on the underpaid labour of women has been a programme especially meant to provide essential services such as education and health is totally unjustified as this misplaced parsimony undermines the larger objectives of the programmes themselves. This practice of recruiting women on non-permanent, part-time or casual roles women are supposed to perform at home. They are expected to serve the community as they do for their families. Their work in these schemes
remains unaccounted in the same way as their work at home.41

Their wages remain far below the minimum wages and the ‘voluntary nature’ of their work renders them extremely vulnerable to exploitation. In fact, despite the doubling of the monthly remuneration of Anganwadi workers and Anganwadi helpers (from Rs. 1500 to Rs. 3000 for AWWs, and from Rs. 750 to Rs. 1500 for AWHS) in Union Budget 2011-12, their wages still remain below minimum wages. On the other hand, ASHAs are not entitled to any kind of honorarium, but are remunerated on the basis of the activities they perform. The estimated maximum compensation that an ASHA is entitled to is approximately Rs. 1433 per month, or Rs.17, 200 per annum. Furthermore, in most states ASHAs are not eligible for any kind of social security. Similar is the case with cooks-cum-helpers. As per a government order issued in November 2009, MDM cook-cum-helpers will be paid Rs. 1000 per month. Although, an attempt has been made to provide them with a regular income, the remuneration still remains well below the minimum wages.

Another extremely disturbing trend is the low levels of fund utilization, in several major schemes/programmes, for women. For instance, Rashtriya Mahila Kosh—the nodal agency for SHGs in India has not registered any expenditure in the last financial year. Another important scheme Mahila Kisan Sashaktikaran Paryojana (MKSP) was introduced in 2009 as part of the National Rural Livelihood Mission, with an initial allocation of a Hundred Crore Rupees. This was an extremely significant step since it recognized the centrality of women in the agricultural sector but as stated earlier, it should not remain confined to the NRLM; women farmers should find a place in every scheme for farmers. It must be highlighted that this year’s GBS (2011-12) makes no mention of it, raising serious doubts about the government’s commitment to implement the same. All that is known about this scheme is that the Ministry of Rural Development has issued guidelines for its implementation only in January 2011. Rajiv Gandhi Scheme for Empowerment of Adolescent Girls too was introduced two years back with the objective of empowering adolescent girls in the age group 11-18 years by bringing improvement in their nutritional and health status and upgrading various life skills. The scheme is currently being implemented through ICDS centres in 200 selected districts across the country on a pilot basis. As per the Summary of Expenditure released by the Ministry of Women and Child Development, against an allocation of a Thousand Crores in 2010-11, actual expenditure incurred till January 15, 2011 is 124 Crore which is a mere 12.4 per cent of the total allocated amount (refer Table 2).

Table 2: Expenditure of Major Schemes Meant for Women

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Scheme</th>
<th>2010-11 BE (Rs. In Crore)</th>
<th>Actual Expenditure Up to 15/1/2011 (Rs. In Crore)</th>
<th>Percentage of Expenditure over BE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Conditional Cash Transfer Scheme for the Girl Child with Insurance Cover</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>1.46</td>
<td>14.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hostels for Working Women</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>5.8</td>
<td>38.67</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>STEP</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>10.79</td>
<td>43.15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rashtriya Mahila Kosh</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Swayamidasidha</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Scheme for Rescue Victims of Trafficking</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>5.26</td>
<td>52.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gender Budgeting</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>.33</td>
<td>16.38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Swadhar</td>
<td>34.2</td>
<td>24.62</td>
<td>69.04</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Relief to and Rehabilitation of Rape Victims</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Priyadarshini</td>
<td>29.79</td>
<td>5.88</td>
<td>19.73</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

It is also imperative to compare the funds allocated from 2007-08 to 2011-12 vis-à-vis the outlay proposed in the Eleventh Five Year Plan, since the year 2011-12 marks the end of the Plan period. The comparison reveals that the proportion of funds allocated vs. the amount proposed for the 11th Plan period is less than 50 per cent in case of Gender Budgeting and Conditional Cash Transfer for girl child with insurance cover. (refer Table 4)

Various studies have shown that the quality of fund utilization in most CSS is poor. Some of the parameters on which the quality of spending has been assessed are:

a. skewed spending across components
b. skewed spending across financial quarters in a year
c. skewed spending across non-wage components etc.
### Table 4: Proposed Outlay for the Eleventh Five Year Plan vis-à-vis Allocations Made in Union Budgets during the five years of the Plan

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name of the Plan Scheme / Programme</th>
<th>Proposed Outlay for Eleventh Plan Rs. in crore (at Current Prices)</th>
<th>Allocations (Rs. In crore)</th>
<th>Total Budget Outlay Made in the five years</th>
<th>% of Allocation Against proposed outlay</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2007-08 (RE)</td>
<td>2008-09 (RE)</td>
<td>2009-10 (RE)</td>
<td>2010-11 (RE)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Swayamsidha</td>
<td>500</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>50.08</td>
<td>.05</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rashtriya Mahila Kosh</td>
<td>108</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gender Budgeting</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.3</td>
<td>.05</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conditional Cash Transfer for girl child with insurance cover</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comprehensive scheme for combating trafficking of women and children (Ujjwala)</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Support to Training and Employment Programme for Women (STEP)</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hostels for Working Women</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Priyadarshini</td>
<td>95</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>1.22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Swadhar</td>
<td>108</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Relief and Rehabilitation of Rape Victims</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rajiv Gandhi National Crèche Scheme</td>
<td>550</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>50.94</td>
<td>50.3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Centre for Budget and Governance Accountability, Response to the Union Budget 2011-12

### Conclusion

There is enough incontrovertible evidence that resources and commodities are unequally distributed between men and women. Everywhere women hold fewer economic resources and have lower earnings than men. It is a case of persistent inequalities and entitlements - be it employment opportunities where terms and conditions are discriminatory; be it productive assets, for example despite their major involvement in the farm sector they do not have land rights; or be it property rights in general. They have limited access to credit through formal bank channels and rely on the micro finance institutions through the SHGs. Much has been written about the

reliance on micro-credit as a panacea to overcome poverty when all it does is to keep them doing unviable small, petty business.

From a gender point of view, what is required is that the generation of livelihoods and employment are the central driving force for growth and that resources generated through growth of GDP feed the social policies that universalize education, health, social security, social welfare, culture and sports. While this will involve a different approach than that currently taken in the Twelfth Plan Approach Paper, it is hoped that during the Twelfth Plan,

- “Livelihood” led growth will be at the centre of inclusive growth. This requires correcting the existing trend of poor quality employment generated by growth that in no way benefits women and many other groups; enabling small producers, in agriculture and non-agriculture, to become more viable and competitive; preventing displacement, loss of livelihoods and environmental degradation in the name of rapid growth.
- If inclusion is the goal then employment generation of high quality (and not primarily underpaid work in the social sector) must be the central goal of Planning.
- Shifting to a livelihood-led growth strategy or an employment-oriented macroeconomic strategy can have many direct and indirect positive effects through strong multiplier effects, including for other policy measures.

Strengthening the gender perspective in developmental planning through sustained reviewing, monitoring, evaluation and therefore improvement is not possible without more frequent and good quality sex disaggregated data on employment conditions (paid and unpaid work), migration, health access and outcomes, education, skills and training, access to food and nutrition outcomes, use of public facilities, control over private and public assets, access to credit, access to land, access to and impact of flagship schemes, fiscal and monetary gender disaggregated data.

\[\text{See for instance Sarmiento, 2011}\]
References


Kumar, Utsav, Jesus Felipe, Unit labour Costs as a Tool for Competitiveness and Policy Analysis. Economic and Political Weekly, Vol. xlvi, No. 40, October 1, 2011.


Sarmiento, Marta Nunez., Cuban Development Alternatives to Market-Driven Economies: A Gendered Case Study on Women’s Employment, in, Devaki Jain and Diane Elson (eds.) Harvesting Feminist Knowledge for Public Policy: Rebuilding Progress, IDRC, Delhi and Sage, Delhi, pp.267-292, 2011.