A BRIEF REVIEW OF PROJECTS UNDER THE DEPARTMENT OF ENVIRONMENT, AND THE DEPARTMENT OF WOMEN AFFAIRS FROM

A GENDER RESPONSIVE DISASTER RISK REDUCTION AND CLIMATE CHANGE ADAPTATION PERSPECTIVE







Table of Contents

BACKGROUND3
OBJECTIVE OF THIS ASSIGNMENT3
METHODOLOGY3
BRIEF INTRODUCTION OF THE ORGANIZATIONS4
REVIEW OF THE SELECTED PROJECTS4
PROGRAMMES OF THE DEPARTMENT OF WOMEN AFFAIRS (DWA)6
ESTABLISHMENT OF KISHOR- KISHORI CLUB
PROGRAMME NAME: ALLOWANCES FOR LACTATING WORKING MOTHER PROGRAMME
PROJECTS OF DEPARTMENT OF ENVIRONMENT
STRENGTHENING AND CONSOLIDATION OF COMMUNITY BASED ADAPTATION IN THE ECOLOGICALLY CRITICAL AREAS THROUGH BIO-DIVERSITY CONSERVATION AND SOCIAL PROTECTION
USING MUNICIPAL ORGANIC WASTE OF TOWNS IN BANGLADESH (PHASE-2)
CONCLUSION21
ANNEX A: DETAILED METHODOLOGY22
ANNEX B: DISASTER RISK REDUCTION/CLIMATE CHANGE RESILIENCE MARKER AND GENDER ANALYSIS

BACKGROUND

Bangladesh, a South Asian developing country, is considered highly vulnerable due to exposure to and impact of climate hazards and disasters (GCRI, 2017). The country faces extreme climatic events on an annual basis, including sea level rise, saltwater intrusion into arable lands, severe storms, cyclones, floods, flash floods and drought (IPCC, 2014; BCCSAP, 2009). In Bangladesh, climate change increases women's socio-economic vulnerabilities by directly impacting food security, water consumption and traditional livelihoods (Tanjeela and Shannon, 2018). In addition, pre-existing discriminatory norms and values result in women's lack of access to resources and services required to build adaptive capacity to climate change impacts. In the Fifth IPCC report, Oppenheimer et al. (2014) suggest a broad set of factors such as wealth, social status, and gender determine vulnerability and exposure to climate-related risk" (2014, p. 1048). Oxfam (Sterrett 2011) and the World Bank (2012) claim that the increasing trend of income inequality and uneven resource distribution that is prominent in some countries in Africa and Asia is also leading to increased vulnerability levels in certain communities. Therefore, vulnerability caused by climate change is strongly connected to unequal resource distribution and poverty levels as well as gender inequality.

Disaster Risk Reduction (DRR) and Climate Change Adaptation (CCA) are key aspects of sustainable development. Bangladesh's first step towards climate change adaptation was through the preparation of the National Adaptation Programme of Action (NAPA) in 2005 in response to the recommendations of the UNFCCC. In 2009 the Bangladesh Climate Change Strategy and Action Plan (BCCSAP) was developed. This strategy remains the country's key policy document on climate change. The Government of Bangladesh has increasingly noted the disproportionate impact of climate change and climate-induced disasters on women. This report is an attempt to briefly review key projects under the Department of Women's Affairs and the Department of Environment's to understand if projects are in fact risk informed and gender responsive in order to meet this growing recognition.

OBJECTIVE OF THIS ASSIGNMENT

The objective of this assignment is to briefly review projects from the DWA and DOE to understand the extent to which select government departments develop risk informed and also gender responsive projects.

METHODOLOGY

The methods employed for this assignment included:

- 1. Inception meeting with UN Women to clarify the scope of the assignment;
- 2. Collection of project documentation from respective departments for long-listing ongoing programmes and projects (Annex –A);
- 3. Projects/programmemes selection in consultation with UN Women for in-depth review and analysis;
- 4. Key Informant Interviews (KIIs) using checklists with the respective department's focal officials;
- 5. Review of the selected projects/ programmes against Gender Marker (see table 1.1 and table 1.2.), and Disaster calendar and risk management criteria.

6. Final report drafted, reviewed, finalised

The assignment took place over several months between January 2019- May 2019. Please refer to Annex-A for the details of data/information collection process.

BRIEF INTRODUCTION OF THE ORGANIZATIONS

Department of Women Affairs

The Department of Women Affairs (DWA) is the implementing arm of the Ministry of Women and Children Affairs (MOWCA) responsible for promoting women's empowerment and women's and children's rights in Bangladesh. DWA is currently working on initiatives to empower women, end violence against women (VAW), stop trafficking of women, the promotion and protection of women in the workplace and more broadly in the social sphere.

Department of Environment

The Department of Environment (DoE) is the government department under the Ministry of Environment, Forest and Climate Change (MoEFCC) responsible for the protection of the environment in Bangladesh. As a department under the MoEFCC, the DoE represents the Government of Bangladesh in numerous international agreements, treaties, laws, conventions, and protocols related to environment and climate change. The department plays a negotiating role on behalf of the Government of Bangladesh in the international climate change negotiations under the UNFCCC. DoE's vision to ensure sustainable environmental governance for achieving high quality of life for the benefit of present and future generation. The mission of DOE is to help secure a clean and healthy environment through:

- the fair and consistent application of environmental rules and regulations,
- guiding, training, and producing awareness of environmental issues,
- sustainable action on critical environmental problems.

Along with regular activities, the department is currently implementing 14 projects under the budgetary allocation of Annual Development Plan and the Bangladesh Climate Change Trust Fund (BCCTF).

REVIEW OF THE SELECTED PROJECTS

The main objective of the assignment was to briefly review projects of DWA and DoE and to assess select projects through gender and climate and/or disaster risk lens. In order to do that, relevant data and information was collected from respective departments and six projects (four from DWA and two from DOE) were selected for systematic review. This review process included assessing project activities using Disaster Risk Reduction/Climate Change Resilience Marker and Gender analysis framework that was developed by the consultant (see Annex-B).¹

Selected projects from DWA:

 Establishment of Kishor-Kishori Club programme: selected as a new programme of DWA with complete country coverage.

¹ Given the diversity of project objectives and outcomes, not all of the categories under the markers/ frameworks could be analysed. Therefore, some analysis focuses more on either climate/disaster risk or gender equality.

- 2. **Vulnerable Group Development (VGD) Programme**: part of the Government of Bangladesh social safety net programme with wide reach across the country.
- 3. **Maternity Allowances Programme (MA):** also, part of the Government of Bangladesh social safety net programme.
- 4. Lactating Mother Allowance Programme (LMA): also, part of the Government of Bangladesh social safety net programme.

All of the select projects make important contributions in the areas of social development and social safety for women, adolescents and children and in particular for vulnerable and disadvantage groups.

Selected projects from DOE:

- Comprehensive Disaster Management Project (CDM) Using Municipal Organic Waste
 of Towns (City Corporation/Municipality) in Bangladesh (Phase-2): based on the
 concept of 3R-reduce, reuse and recycle for urban waste management. The project has
 created waste management practices of households, community and job opportunities
 for low-income urban women.
- 2. Strengthening and Consolidation of Community Based Adaption in the Ecologically Critical Areas through Biodiversity Conservation and Social Protection Project (CBA-ECA): supports local communities to become more resilient in adapting to impacts of climate change ecological vulnerable areas. The aim of this project is to reduce vulnerability and increase the adaptive capacity of the local people.

The following sections and subsections will detail the brief analysis of all six projects.

Programmes of the Department of Women Affairs (DWA)

Establishment of Kishor- Kishori Club

The establishment of the Kishore-Kishori Club is an initiative of DWA aimed to build a skilled and well-rounded young generation who can be agents of social change. The programme has been developed based on the success of a pilot project of the same name implemented from 2012-2017 in 379 unions of 7 districts from 7 divisions of Bangladesh. The details of the project are presented below.

Objectives of the programme:

- ✓ To develop capabilities of marginalized adolescent boys and girls on social issues which aims to prevent early marriage and gender-based violence.
- ✓ To build social awareness about sexual and reproductive health and rights (SRHR)
- ✓ To bring positive changes in the society through their involvement in different innovative and cultural activities.

Implementation period:

April 2018-December 2020 (Field level activities have not started yet)

Geographical Coverage:

4553 Unions and 330 Municipalities of Bangladesh

Activity profile:

- ✓ Total 4883 clubs will be established in 4553 Unions and 330 Municipalities all over Bangladesh.
- ✓ Each club comprises 30 members aged between 10-19 years (20 girls and 10 boys) and total 439 470 adolescent boys and girls will be member of these clubs.
- ✓ Comprehensive life skills training including early marriage prevention, gender-based violence, Sexual Reproductive Health Rights (SRHR), birth registration, marriage registration, dowry, eve teasing, child rights, legal aid, HIV AIDS, personal safety will be provided to all club members.
- ✓ Different national days will be celebrated as a part of the club activities.
- ✓ Self-defence training, including Karate/tykondo, will be provided for the club members.
- ✓ A total 2946 women entrepreneurs will be supported to produce sanitary napkin as part of knowledge and access to menstrual health for adolescents as well as small business opportunities for women.
- ✓ A local primary school's facilities will be used for club activities and club members will meet two days each week.

The project activities and implementing modalities were reviewed using the Disaster Risk Reduction/Climate Change Resilience Marker and Gender analysis framework that were developed for the assignment (see Annex-B). Only relevant criteria from these markers are presented in Table 1.

Table 1: Evaluation of the Kishor-Kishori Club Programmeme of DWA

COMPONENT	Checklist	Yes	Partial	No	Remarks
The programme is risk informed	Is the programme able to adapt or scale up their activities in the event of future hazards or threats?		√		Since the programme will be implemented with the involvement of local community and local administration so it is possible to cope with future hazards
The programme strengthens local capacities to cope with shocks and stresses	Does it address alternative livelihood/sustainable livelihood for women to strengthen their economic empowerment?	V			The programme has a component for developing women entrepreneurs. A total 2946 women entrepreneurs will be developed for sanitary napkin production from the target areas. Total 439 470 adolescent boys and girls will be provided life skill training through the club activities
A deliberate strategy for sustainability and feasibility	The initial analysis is developed in consultation with other actors and stakeholders?	√			Local level consultation with stakeholders and end line survey of the Kishor-kishori club programme implemented from 2012-2017
	As much as the context permits, does the programme link and contribute to relevant government plans or strategies?	√			National Women development Policy 2011 (article 18 and article 26) 7th Five Year plan
Recognition of the differentiated gender needs	Does the project count/consider different population groups?	√			Target population of this programme is both adolescent girls and boys though number of girls is more than boys
Gender responsive supports/services	Do women have equal accessibility of the services or activities of the project?	√			Yes
	Have women equal control over the decisions on the services?	√			Each club will have two peer leaders (one girl and one boy) that will ensure equal control over services
Adequate participation and leadership of different gender/sex groups	Does the project consider women as an equal stakeholder? How are women included in the project activities?	✓			Girls have equal participation in leadership roles. Each club will have two peer leaders (one girl and one boy) to manage and supervise the club activities. More importantly, the girl peer leader will be older than the boy peer leader so that girl leader can play the main leadership role
	Have women been given leadership positions in the project activities?	√			Each club will have one girl peer leader who will be older than the boy peer leader.
Gender responsive steps to review equal benefits	What are the steps to assess the benefits of the projects?		√		Developing Female entrepreneurs, and peer leaders
	Does the project have the option of gender analysis for monitoring or evaluation to assess its gender responsive targets?	√			Mid-term and end line evaluation
	Does the projects have sex disaggregated data /information?	✓			

The programme contributes to the implementation of the Women Development Policy 2011 (article 18 and article 26), SDG (goal 5) and 7th five-year plan (human resource development) of the Government of Bangladesh. The programme considers both adolescent girls and boys in targeted

geographical areas with a total of 292 980 girls and 146 490 boys to be members of 4883 clubs. One of the major components of the programme is to build capacities of the club members through life skills training which includes early marriage prevention, gender-based violence, SRHR, birth registration, marriage registration, dowry, eve teasing, child rights, legal aid, HIV AIDS, personal

safety issues. These key gender equality issues contribute to the overall gender responsiveness of the programme.

With regards to sustainability and climate change /disaster risk, the project does not feature reference to potential threats or strategies to deal with risks. The programme did not conduct any analysis of shocks, stresses and vulnerabilities during project formulation however, some components do have the scope to address risk in different components and stages of the programme.

The programme's objective was different so disaster or climate change issues were not considered during proposal planning. But still has scope to incorporate the issues in the training module to make them aware and during club area selection (Farhana Akhter, Research officer-KKI. 4)

Vulnerable Group Development Programme (VGD)

The Government of Bangladesh has many safety net programmes targeted to the poorest and most vulnerable within society. The Government introduced the Vulnerable Group Feeding (VGF) programme, a food-based relief programme in 1975, as humanitarian response to food insecurity in a war torn and disaster affected country. The VGF Programme was redesigned from humanitarian relief to a development project with focus on women, becoming the Vulnerable Group Development (VGD) programme in 1982. The VGD programme has gradually evolved over the years to address the marginalization of the vulnerable poor, including the feminized aspects of poverty, with special attention being given to the food security and nutrition status of disadvantaged women. MoWCA and DWA became the implementing agency from 1993. VGD is considered a major success in addressing extreme poverty in the country.

Long -term objective:

"To make positive change in livelihood of ultra-poor women with attention to protect further deterioration of living condition" (VGD implementation guideline, P.3)

Short -term objectives:

- 1) "Integrated food consumption and income generation activities"
- 2) "Promote healthy behaviour and women empowerment" (VGD implementation guideline, P.4)

Geographical coverage:

10 000 women are selected from across Bangladesh for a period of 24 months.

Activity profile:

- √ 10 000 ultra-poor women headed households receive a monthly 30 Kg rice combined with
 a package of development services for 24 months.
- ✓ Delivering a development package which includes life skills and income generating skills training as well as a personal savings programme and access to micro-credit/NGO membership.

✓ Awareness training on maternal health, nutrition, neonatal care, sanitation, as well as income generating training opportunities such as poultry raising, horticulture etc. through links with NGOs

The project activities and implementing modalities were reviewed by **Disaster Risk** Reduction/Climate Change Resilience Marker and Gender analysis framework that were developed for the assignment (see Annex-B).

The criteria met by VGD programme are presented in the following table (2).

Table 2: Evaluation of the VGD Programme of DWA

COMPONENT	Checklist	Yes	Partial	No	Remarks
Consideration of vulnerability, hazards and threats	Does project consider disaster vulnerabilities during project design? Does project consider specifically gender- differentiated vulnerabilities into project design?	√			Programme considered Vulnerability Mapping produced by Bangladesh Bureau of Statistics (BBS). All beneficiaries are rural ultra-poor women, so women's vulnerabilities are partially considered by the programme
The project/programme is risk informed	Does the project conduct risk analysis from a gender perspective? Does the project consider risk during project design?		√		Not directly but the programme is targeted to ultra-poor women as the poorest amongst the poor population.
	Does the programme include adequate measures for protecting beneficiaries from risks?		✓		Not directly but in order to ensure food security of the beneficiaries during normal and disaster time they receive 30 kg rice per month.
	Is the programme able to adapt or scale up their activities in the event of future hazards or threats?		√		Number of beneficiaries varies from normal unions to areas with high level of poverty and plans to introduce social insurance schemes for the beneficiaries are being considered.
The project/programme strengthens local capacities to cope with shocks and stresses	Does the project optimise opportunities to strengthen livelihoods and coping capacities against shocks and stresses? Does it address alternative livelihood/sustainable livelihood for women to strengthen their economic empowerment?		√		The programme has measures to build capacities of the beneficiaries by providing income generating training, savings scheme and life skill training through selected NGOs which in turns help them to create alternative livelihoods after completing the programme cycle.
	As much as the context permits, does the programme link and contribute to relevant government plans or strategies?	√			Women Development Policy 2011, National Social Security Strategy, 7th Five Year plan
Recognition of the differentiated gender needs	Does the project count/consider different population groups?		√		The project considers poorest women of the community
Gender responsive support services	Does the project identify the gender specific needs (Practical or strategic)?		✓		Programme provides food support (30kg rice per month) for the beneficiaries meets up the immediate or practical gender needs for women
Adequate participation and leadership of different gender/sex groups	Do women have the equal accessibility of the services or activities of the project?	√			Yes, since women are the only beneficiaries of the project
	Does the project have sufficient budget and resources to achieve gender targets?	√			Yes, the programme covers 10000 women for 24 months cycle with the target to bring them up from below the poverty line.

The programme follows the country's poverty vulnerability map produced by Bangladesh Bureau of Statistics (BBS) to identify beneficiaries but the eligibility criteria to obtain a VGD card is not aligned with the current climate change or disaster risk and vulnerabilities. Even though the VGF programme in its original form of VGD was formed to provide unconditional food aid and cash to combat lean seasons and natural disasters in 1975, at this time, DWA does not apply a climate change/disaster risk lens to the programme.

Since there is an interrelation between disaster and poverty so this programme is to some extent related to disaster risk reduction as more beneficiaries are selected from the poverty and disaster prone areas. Our future plan is to introduce health insurance for VGD beneficiaries. We also incorporated disaster management and climate change issues in the training module for the beneficiaries (Abul Kashem, Deputy Director, VGD -KII.3).

- The programme is partially disaster risk informed and includes some measures which may reduce or address risks, such as training on disaster management and impact of climate change in life skills training modules.
- The programme has measures to build capacities of the beneficiaries by providing income generating training, access to savings schemes and life skills training.
- The programme links and contributes to implementation of the Women Development Policy 2011 (article 24: poverty elimination of women; article 30: food security of women), National Social Security Strategy, SDG1: No poverty and SDG2: zero hunger and 7th Five-Year

plan (article 1.3&1.4: reducing poverty, gender equality, income inequality and social protection)

In terms of gender responsiveness, the programme does consider the immediate needs of the most vulnerable and poorest women in society and provides food support. This is targeted towards widows, the disabled and female-headed households who are most marginalised. The programme mainly focuses on food delivery and meeting practical gender needs, not strategic gender interests. Beneficiaries are not tracked beyond the programme cycle, making it impossible to assess the sustainability of programme and evaluate how benefits contribute to gender equality or not.

Currently, limited attention is paid to climate change/disaster risk. Yet, a number of key changes could improve this programme to make it more risk informed:

- Disaster-prone areas could get special consideration and more beneficiaries from the most disaster-prone districts, upazillas and unions could be targeted. The country's disaster vulnerability map can be taken into consideration alongside the poverty vulnerability map;
- Women affected by disasters or climate change impacts could be given priority in beneficiary selection;
- The food distribution could be scheduled during the climate hazard season in disaster prone districts to help with humanitarian assistance during disaster response;
- More than only practical needs (such as food supply), strategic interests such as women's
 engagement in community decisions making related to disaster risk reduction is one way
 to increase both the gender responsiveness and risk informed nature of the programme.

Maternity allowance programme for poor rural mothers

Maternity Allowance (MA) programme was introduced in 2007 to provide financial assistance to

poor pregnant women in rural Bangladesh to improve health and nutrition of both the mother and the baby. The programme targets poor pregnant women in rural areas providing a monthly allowance over a two-year period. A training component alongside the monthly payment aims to address a number of health and nutrition concerns related to pregnancy and newborns, including stages of the pregnancy and danger signs, the birth and other key development milestones.

Objectives:

To ensure a healthy future generation of the country.

- ✓ To reduce maternal and child mortality.
- ✓ To increase breast feeding practice.
- ✓ To enhance antenatal and post-natal care
- ✓ To increase Expanded Programme on Immunisation (EPI) and family planning measures
- ✓ To encourage birth registration
- ✓ Increase nutritional food intake during pregnancy
- ✓ To identify Autism through early screening and awareness training and care
- ✓ To aware people about neuro and mental disorder
- ✓ To support achievement of SDG goals

Geographical Coverage: All over Bangladesh, delivered at the union level

Activity profile:

- 1. Selection of beneficiary, where Union committee prepare list of eligible beneficiaries with NGO support annually and Upazilla committee give final approval.
- 2. Cash transfer to beneficiaries.
- 3. Training on reproductive health, nutrition and income generating activities.

Eligibility criteria of the allowance holders

- First pregnancy only
- Age limit 20 -35 years
- Monthly income below 800 BDT
- Poor mothers with disability will get priority
- People living on their own land or any other person's land

The project activities and implementing modalities were reviewed by Disaster Risk Reduction/Climate Change Resilience Marker and Gender analysis framework that were developed for the assignment (see Annex-B). The criteria or checklists of the markers met by the programme are presented in the following table (3). It is to be noted that the rest of the criteria which do not fit/match with the objectives and activities of the programme are omitted.

Table 3: Evaluation of the MA Programme of DWA

COMPONENT	Checklist	Yes	Partial	No	Remarks
Consideration of vulnerability, hazards and threats	What types of vulnerabilities that the projects capture through baseline and other surveys? Does project consider these during project design? Does project consider gender differentiated vulnerabilities into project design?		√		Similar to the VGD programme, the poverty map produced by BBS is the baseline for beneficiary selection. As the beneficiaries of the programme are women, women's poverty driven vulnerability is considered by the programme
The project/programme strengthens local capacities to cope with shocks and stresses	Does the project optimise opportunities to strengthen livelihoods and coping capacities against shocks and stresses? Does it address alternative livelihood/sustainable livelihood for women to strengthen their economic empowerment?		√		Not targeted to alternative livelihood programmes but has option of life skill trainings for beneficiaries
A deliberate strategy for sustainability and feasibility	As much as the context permits, does the programme links and contributes to relevant government plans or strategies	√			National Social Security Strategy-2015, Child policy-2013
Recognition of the differentiated gender needs	Does the project count/consider different population groups?				The project considers only women group
	Does the project identify the gender specific needs (Practical or strategic)		√		Women's practical needs because the programme give monthly allowances for poor pregnant women
Gender Responsive supports/ services	Do women have the equal accessibility of the services or activities of the project?				Women are the only beneficiaries
Adequate participation and leadership of different gender/sex groups	Does the project consider women as an equal stakeholder? How women are included in the project activities?		✓		Women are only beneficiaries of the programme
	Does the project have sufficient budget and resources to achieve gender targets?	√			

The programme is targeted to a special group of women and focuses on their health during pregnancy and the health of their child. The programme does aim to target the disabled poor women and female-headed households. While financial allowances cannot create significant difference in health and wellbeing without an enabling environment, the demand for financial support and access to basic health information is needed for this vulnerable group of new mothers. Given the project only focuses on women, it is hard to assess how it will contribute to gender equality. Fortunately, programme data and information are being gathered and store digitally for future monitoring and there is adequate budgetary allocation and good area coverage across the country.

Similar to the VGD programme, to make the programme more risk-informed, disaster-prone areas could receive special consideration and more beneficiaries from the most disaster-prone districts, upazillas and unions could be selected. This includes considering the country's disaster vulnerability map. Women affected by recent disasters or climate change impacts could be given priority in beneficiary selection.

Programme Name: Allowances for Lactating Working mother programme

Allowances for working Lactating Mothers (LMA) programme targets poor pregnant/lactating mothers of urban slum areas and aims to improve their health and nutritional situation both during pregnancy and after birth. The programme started in 2010 with the employees of garments and textile factories and currently has 2.5 lac beneficiaries receiving 800 Bangladeshi Taka monthly allowance over a three-year period. Along with financial assistance, beneficiaries receive training on a number of health and nutrition issues related to pregnancy and newborns, stages of pregnancy and danger signs and child birth.

Specific objectives

- ✓ To provide financial support for poor urban working women during their pregnancy
- ✓ To improve the quality of life, socio-economic conditions and nutritional status of urban poor working women.
- ✓ To reduce the maternal and infant mortality rate with a focus on breastfeeding.
- √ To enhance antenatal and post-natal care
- ✓ To increase EPI and family planning measures

Geographical Coverage: The Garments and textile factories belonging Bangladesh Garment Manufacturers and Exporters Association (BGMEA) and Bangladesh Knitwear Manufacturers Exporters Association (BKMEA) of Dhaka, Narayangonj and Gazipur and city corporation areas/head quarter of rest of the 61 districts of Bangladesh.

Activity profile:

- 1. Selection of garment factories and textile industries by BGMEA and BKMEA
- 2. Selection of beneficiary by city corporation in rest of the districts
- 3. Cash transfer through Bank
- 4. Provide training on reproductive health, nutrition and income generating activities through selected NGOS/CBOS and BGMEA and BKMEA.

The project activities and implementing modalities were reviewed using the Disaster Risk Reduction/Climate Change Resilience Marker and Gender analysis framework that were developed for the assignment (see Annex-B). The criteria or checklists of the markers met by the programme are presented in the following table (4). It is to be noted that the rest of the criteria do not fit/match because the scope and type of the programme.

Table 4: Evaluation of the LMA Programme of DWA

COMPONENT	Checklist	Yes	Partial	No	Remarks
Consideration of vulnerability, hazards and threats	What types of vulnerabilities that the projects capture through baseline and other surveys? Does project consider these during project design? Does project consider gender differentiated vulnerabilities into project design?		✓		An initiative by the Finance ministry in back to 2010-2011 targeting to poor rural pregnant women between the age group 20-35years. Similar to the VGD programme, the poverty map produced by BBS is applied as the baseline for beneficiary selection. Since poverty and disaster have a close connection there is some indirect relationship. As the beneficiaries of the programme are women, women's poverty driven vulnerability is being addressed by the programme
	Is the programme able to adapt or scale up their activities in the event of future hazards or threats?		√		In terms of number of beneficiaries, the programme has the ability to scale up as needed.
The project/program me strengthens local capacities to cope with shocks and stresses	Does the project optimise opportunities to strengthen livelihoods and coping capacities against shocks and stresses? Does it address alternative livelihood/sustainable livelihood for women to strengthen their economic empowerment?		✓		Not targeted to alternative livelihood programmes but has option of life skills training for beneficiaries
A deliberate strategy for sustainability and feasibility	As much as the context permits, does the programme links and contributes to relevant government plans or strategies	√			National Social Security Strategy-2015, Child policy-2013
Recognition of the differentiated gender needs	Does the project count/consider different population group?				N/A The project considers only women group
	Does the project identify the gender specific needs (Practical or strategic)		✓		Women's practical needs only as the programme provides monthly allowances for poor pregnant women
Gender Responsive supports/service s	Do women have the equal accessibility of the services or activities of the project?				N/A
Adequate participation and leadership of different gender/sex groups	Does the project consider women as an equal stakeholder? How women are included in the project activities?		✓		Women are only beneficiaries of the programme
Gender responsive steps	Does the projects have gender disaggregated data /information?	√			The programme only works with women.

to review equal	Does the project have	√		
benefits	sufficient budget and			
	resources to achieve			
	gender targets?			

The objective of programme is to reduce maternal and child mortality along with improving the overall health condition of poor mothers and their babies. Both programmes (MA & LMA) are similar in nature and objectives only difference is in implementing area and beneficiary coverage. The programme looks to improve the situation of women, by providing them with essential information and skills related to pregnancy, childbirth and lactation while working. This programme is focused on women in particular, similar to the MA programme and therefore it's difficult to assess the programmes impact on gender equality.

Similar to the VDG and MA programmes, to make the programme more risk-informed, disaster-prone areas could receive special consideration and more beneficiaries from the most disaster-prone districts, upazillas and unions could be selected. This includes considering the country's disaster vulnerability map. Women affected by recent disasters or climate change impacts could be given priority in beneficiary selection. Additional training content, such as training to cope with shock and crisis during disaster as well as income generating livelihood activities for rural women can be considered.

Projects of Department of Environment

Strengthening and Consolidation of Community based Adaptation in the Ecologically Critical Areas through Bio-diversity Conservation and Social Protection

The Bangladesh Environment Conservation Act, 1995 authorizes the Ministry of Environment and Forests on behalf of the Government of Bangladesh to declare a site as an Ecologically Critical Area (ECA). Since this time until 2015, the Government has declared 13 sites as ECAs with the goal of improving and conserving the health of ecosystems. The Coastal and Wetland Biodiversity Management Project (CWBMP) that focuses on ECA management and local communities' engagement in ECAs was delivered between 2002–2011 and the second phase of this project, "Community Based Adaptation in the Ecologically Critical Areas through Biodiversity Conservation and Social Protection Project (CBA-ECA Project)" was implemented during 2011–2015 in Hakaluki Haor, Cox's Bazar-Teknaf Peninsula and Sonadia Island ECAs. The CBA-ECA project focused on enhancing resilience of the people within ECAs by organizing and engaging them in biodiversity conservation and habitat restoration. The project has also successfully engaged communities in establishing wetland sanctuaries in Hakaluki Haor.

Objective: Climate sensitive communities in and around the Ecologically Critical Areas (ECA) are conserving biodiversity resources, diversifying their livelihoods and implementing and maintaining climate adaptation and mitigation.

Coverage: Two ecologically critical areas of Bangladesh- Hakaluki haor and Cox's Bazar-Teknaf Peninsula which were declared as ECA under the provisions of Bangladesh Environment Conservation Act, 1995 (Amended 2010).

Key activities

- a) Development of Village Conservation Group (VCG), in the neighbouring areas of Hakaluki Haor and Cox's Bazar-Teknaf Peninsula;
- b) Strengthen VCG capacity in habitat restoration and protection, biodiversity conservation, climate change adaption and mitigation activities;
- c) Provide training to the members of the VCGs to encourage alternative livelihoods of the members of village conservation groups in the project area;
- d) Establishment of two solar powered irrigation pumps for the benefit of Farmer's farm in Hakaluki Haor. Ten Engine Engagements for use in diverse work including habitat sanctuaries, bird sanctuary and wildlife habitats built and protected by mangroves and wetland forests, wetland sanctuaries, birds and wild animals created through various projects of Environment
- e) Cox's Bazar-Teknaf Peninsula Touristic Caring Capacity Radiated Practice Study in Inani Beach Area in Neighborly Concerned Area.

The project activities and implementing modalities were reviewed by Disaster Risk Reduction/Climate Change Resilience Marker and Gender analysis framework that were developed for the assignment (see Annex-B). The checklists of the markers met by the programme are presented in the following table (5). It is noted that some parts of the checklists do not match because of the nature of the programme and hence these have been omitted.

Table 5 Evaluation of CBA-ECA Project of DoE

COMPONENT	Checklist	Yes	Partial	No	Remarks
Consideration of vulnerability, hazards and threats	Does the project conduct any baseline/survey to see the type of hazards that affect the beneficiary groups?		√		No baseline survey but the project was developed through a Union based Participatory Action Plan Development (PAPD) process
	What types of vulnerabilities that the projects capture through baseline and other surveys?	✓			Ecological vulnerabilities of Hakaluki Haor, Sylhet and Moulvibazar District, Cox's Bazar – Teknaf Peninsula
	What types of capacities that the project capture through baseline and other survey? Does project consider gender differentiated capacities into project design?		√		Through community-based activities –the project formed Village Conservation Group (VCG) consisting 30% women members
	Does the project follow Participatory CRA process in identifying vulnerabilities and capacity of targeted population?	√			Union level Participatory Action Plan development (PAPD) process with all stakeholders
The project/programm e is risk informed	Does the project conduct risk analysis? Does it from gender perspective? Does the project consider risk during project design?		√		Main objective of the project to identify ecological risk of climate change and it does not completely consider gender issues

	Is the programme able to	/			Voc
	Is the programme able to adapt or scale up their	✓			Yes
	activities in the event of future				
	hazards or threats?				
The	Are capacities of beneficiaries		/		
project/programm	and local institutions to		V		
e strengthens local	absorb, respond and recover				
capacities to cope	to these shocks and threats,				
with shocks and	including resource availability				
stresses	analysed?				
311 03303	Does the project optimise	√			
	opportunities to strengthen	V			
	livelihoods and coping				
	capacities against shocks and				
	stresses? Does it address				
	alternative				
	livelihood/sustainable				
	livelihood for women to				
	strengthen their economic				
	empowerment?				
A deliberate	The initial analysis is	√			Yes, through PAPD process
strategy for	developed in consultation with				
sustainability and	other actors and stakeholders?				
feasibility	As much as the context	✓			BCCSAP-2009
	permits, does the programme				7th Five Year plan
	links and contributes to				
	relevant government plans or				
	strategies				
Recognition of the	Does the project	✓			Yes, both men and women are
differentiated	count/consider different				member of VCG but the project
gender needs	population group?				doesn't identify or target other
	Does the project identify the				social groups.
	gender specific needs				Practical gender needs only,
	(Practical or strategic)				including livelihood support
Gender Responsive			√		Not fully equal since women's
supports/services	Do women have the equal				share is 30% in VCG group
	accessibility of the services or				
	activities of the project?				
	Have women equal control			✓	
	over the decision on the				
	services?				
Adequate	Does the project consider		✓		Women are included as the
participation and	women as an equal				members of VCG group
leadership of	stakeholder? How women are				
different	included in the project				
gender/se	activities?				
x groups	Have women in leadership	✓			Limited VCGs have a female
	position in the project				chairperson and cashier but
	activities?				cultural barriers remain a major
					challenge particularly in the Sylhet
Condon noon and in-	Door the project set				region
Gender responsive	Does the project set gender		√		
steps to review	responsive goal and				
equal benefits	objectives?				

D	oes the projects have the sex	√		Yes
di	isaggregated data			
/i	nformation?			

The main focus of the project is the ecological vulnerabilities of the area threaten by climate change. The project focuses very little on the vulnerabilities of the communities (women and men and other social groups) and rather looks at the livelihood options and management of the ECA through the village conservation group (VCG). The project currently has 75 VCGs and among those, 30% of all members are women. Other than ensuring some participation of women, the project doesn't consider other gender related issues. It was found that in Cox's bazar there are some women VCG members creating a *women's space* where women can come together discuss issues, however this was not part of the project design.

In terms of alternative livelihood options and training for communities within the ECA, different types of capacity and skill management training such as leadership development, organisational and financial management, and community led monitoring trainings were provided by the project. According to the project document a total of about 5,000 community members were trained on 65 different alternative income generation activities (eg small business, livestock rearing, vegetable cultivation, ecotourism, and poultry rearing) with 45% female participation. It demonstrates that the project is able to build capacity for a large number of local community people where women's share is significant.

Using Municipal Organic Waste of Towns in Bangladesh (Phase-2)

To address the solid waste management problem in Bangladesh particularly in city areas the Department of Environment with the financial assistance of Bangladesh Climate Change Trust Fund and technical assistance of Government of Denmark has initiated the programme Using Municipal Organic Waste of Towns (City Corporation/Municipality). The project aims to sell Certified Emission Reduction (CER) in the international carbon market to increase income which reduces waste disposal cost of the city authority. Initially the project timeframe was for eight years (2012-2019) and now a second phase is in place until June 2020.

Objectives of the project

- 1. Reduction of Green House Gas (GHC) from the waste sector
- 2. Introduction of 3R (Reduce, Reuse and Recycle) concept
- 3. Awareness building among the city dwellers about 3R concept
- 4. Building clean and healthy city in Bangladesh
- 5. Providing alternative income generation activities to poor people of urban areas by converting waste to compost fertilizer
- 6. Providing additional financial assistance for waste management through selling CER in the international CDM market.
- 7. Improving soil quality by using organic fertilizer

Project area:

Narayanganj City Corporation, Mymensing Pouroshava, Rangpur City Corporation, Cox's Bazar Pouroshava

Activities of the Project

- Baseline survey for the estimation of the rate of waste generation in the urban areas
- Baseline survey for identification of physicochemical characteristics of waste generated in the urban areas in Bangladesh
- Baseline survey for GHC emission in the municipal waste sector
- Preparation of project note and project design for programmatic CDM for 64 districts
- Training and awareness building for implementation of 3R concept in waste management system
- Waste collection and separation involving civil society and NGOs
- Construction of compost plant in project areas
- Producing compost fertilizer using organic waste through compost plant
- Marketing the organic fertilizer through the dealers affiliated with agriculture ministry
- Selling CER in the international carbon market

The project activities and implementing modalities were reviewed using the Disaster Risk Reduction/Climate Change Resilience Marker and Gender analysis framework that were developed for the assignment (see Annex-B). The checklists of the markers that are met by the programme presented in the following table (6).

Table 6 Evaluation of CDM Project of DoE

COMPONENT	Checklist	Yes	Partial	No	Remarks
A deliberate strategy for sustainability and feasibility	The initial analysis is developed in consultation with other actors and stakeholders?	√			Yes, through consultative process with stakeholders
	As much as the context permits, does the programme links and contributes to relevant government plans or strategies	✓			BCCSAP-2009
Recognition of the differentiated gender needs	Does the project count/consider different population group?	✓			
	Does the project identify the gender specific needs (Practical or strategic)		√		
Gender Responsive supports/services	Do women have the equal accessibility of the services or activities of the project?	√			
Adequate participation and leadership of different gender/sex groups	Does the project consider women as an equal stakeholder? How women are included in the project activities?	1			

Does the project have the option of gender analysis for monitoring or evaluation to assess its gender responsive targets?		√	Mid-term and end line evaluation
Does the projects have the sex disaggregated data /information?	√		
e. Does the project have sufficient budget and resources to achieve gender targets?		√	

Most of the activities under the project are technical in nature which makes analysis difficult using the markers developed for this report. Therefore, only three components / activities of the project were reviewed to understand the gender responsiveness of the project. The components were - Training and awareness building for implementation of 3R concept (reduce, reuse and recycle) in waste management system; producing compost fertilizer using organic waste through compost plant and marketing the organic fertilizer through the dealers affiliated with agriculture ministry.

Since women play a vital role at household level waste management the project considered women as an important stakeholder in all stages from waste separation to waste collection. The project regularly arranges community meetings and awareness raising to ensure it reaches women and encourages women's participation. Further, women from different households were trained in different issues such as how to implement the 3R concept for waste management, the benefit of waste separation at household level and the household's organic and non-organic waste separation.

In terms of participation poor, urban women are engaged as daily labourer in the waste compost plant in order to provide alternative income generation activities to poor people of urban areas. Currently 58 workers are working in the compost plant and 48 of them are women. It is noted that supervisors are all male workers.

CONCLUSION

This report presents a brief review of select projects of DWA and DOE to assess the initiatives from gender lens as well as from the lens of disaster risk. From the brief analysis, it can be concluded that currently programmes under DWA are yet to integrate comprehensive risk analysis into their design. These programmes would be able to improve their relevance if a risk lens was applied in the design of the programme, and vulnerable populations including women and other marginalised groups affected by climate-hazards and disasters were prioritised. Practical steps such as integrating disaster/climate change related awareness raising into training modules and the inclusion of Bangladesh's vulnerability map as a tool for identify vulnerable regions and populations would be relatively effective was to begin adopting risk-informed approaches within DWA programmes.

From the brief analysis of DOE programmes, some effort to incorporate gender-based needs into different components of the programmes as well as encouraging women's participation is evident. Most often, a practical needs-based approach is taken, such as fulfilling women's basic needs and priorities such a livelihood opportunities or support in their household roles. The strategic needs of women, which can contribute to gender equality, are not considered in these programmes. Women are seen in their stereotypical roles, such as key caretakers of the home, however the programmes of DOR need to move beyond this traditional view of women and aim to understand gender equality and how to engage women as agents of change in climate-related projects.

Annex A: Detailed methodology

Methods	Number of Visit and working days	Activities	Major Objectives	Respondents
Discussion	2	Inception meeting with UN Women staff	To get clarity on the assignment	Respective staff of UN- Women
Discussion	4	Meeting with the heads of the departments	To be introduced to key stakeholders and discuss the assignment.	Director General (DG) of DWA and DoE
Meeting	6	Listing out relevant, on-going and pipeline projects of DoE and DWA	List of the on-going and pipelines projects	Respective officials of DWA and DOE
Meeting	1	Review shortlisted projects for finalisation in consultation with UN Women.	Shortlist Safety-net programmes of DWA and CCA projects of DoE	Respective staff of UN- Women
KII and project documents collection	6	Collect additional documentation of the select projects for in depth review.	To gather information of the selected programmes and projects	Respective officials of DWA and DOE
KII, FGD and Document analysis	4	Conduct focus group discussion, and key informant interviews to support document review	To obtain in depth information on the select programmes and projects	Respective officials of DWA and DOE
Report writing	7	Assess projects against analytical tools and markers identified (Annex B)	Develop draft report for circulation	N/A

Annex B: Disaster Risk Reduction/Climate Change Resilience Marker and Gender analysis framework

Two frameworks have been developed for the analysis. The first one is the Disaster Risk Reduction (DRR)/Climate Change Resilience (CCR) Marker and the second one is the Gender Analysis Framework/Gender Marker. These markers guided the analysis for this report.

1. Disaster Risk Reduction/Climate Change Resilience Marker

This Marker is a tool to assess to what extent projects integrate DRR /CCR considerations. The criteria are presented in the table below:

Criterion /markers for DRR/ Climate Change Resilience:

Does the programme/project include an adequate analysis of shocks, stresses and vulnerabilities?	Yes	Not Sufficiently	No
Is the programme/project risk informed? Does the project include adequate measures to ensure aggravate risks or undermine capacities?	Yes	Not Sufficiently	No
Does the programme/project include measures to build local capacities by assessing impacts (beneficiaries + local communities)?	Yes	Not Satisfactory	No
Does the project take opportunities to Support long-term strategies for sustainability and feasibility?	Yes	Not Satisfactory	No

To help understand in more detail if projects considered DRR/CCR, the following checklist were developed.

Checklists for analysis:

The checklists were prepared in line with BCCSAP (2009) particularly focusing on pillar 1: Food security, Social protection and Health and Pillar 2: Comprehensive Disaster Management. Pillar one clearly indicates that "Increase the resilience of vulnerable groups, including women and children, through development of community-level adaptation, livelihood diversification, better access to basic services and social protection (e.g., safety nets, insurance) and scaling up"(BCCSAP, 2009, P.25). Similarly, regarding DRR issues it is mentioned in BCCSAP that "Strengthen the government's capacity and that of civil society partners and communities to manage natural disasters, and ensure that appropriate policies, laws and regulations are in place" (p.25).

1. Consideration of vulnerability, hazards and threats

- Does any type of hazards affect the beneficiary groups?
- What types of vulnerabilities they have?
- What capacities do they have to cope with them?
- What can be their coping mechanism?

2. The project/programme is risk informed

• Does the programme include adequate measures for protecting beneficiaries from risks?

• Is the programme able to adapt or scale up their activities in the event of future hazards or threats?

3. The project/programme strengthens local capacities to cope with shocks and stresses

- Are capacities of beneficiaries and local institutions to absorb, respond and recover to these shocks and threats, including resource availability analysed?
- Does the project optimise opportunities to strengthen livelihoods and coping capacities against shocks and stresses?
- Does the project optimise opportunities to support local efforts across sectors to manage risks?

4. A deliberate strategy for sustainability and feasibility

- The initial analysis is developed in consultation with other actors and stakeholders?
- The project demonstrates a good understanding of the multi-sectoral assistance required and of who delivers it and complements or supports other assistance plans where beneficial
- As much as the context permits, does the programme links and contributes to relevant government plans or strategies?

2.Gender Analysis Framework/Gender Marker

Gender analysis provides information on the different roles of women and men at different levels in policies, programmemes and projects; their respective access to and control over resources, and the material and non-material benefits of society; and their gender-specific needs, priorities and responsibilities (IEGE, 2009).

There are several gender analysis frameworks and most of these frameworks consider following four conditions for any development programme or project analysis.

- 1) The recognition of the differentiated gender needs
- 2) Gender responsive supports/services
- 3) Adequate participation and leadership of different gender/sex groups
- 4) Gender responsive steps to review equal benefits

These four components are presented in the table below:

Does the project include the needs, roles and dynamics of women, girls, boys and men?	Yes	Not Sufficiently	No
Do all the beneficiaries (women / girls, men) get the proper resources or services?	Yes	Not Sufficiently	No
Has the project satisfactory level of women's participation?	Yes	Not Satisfactory	No

Does the projects consider women in leadership position?			
Do the projects ensue the equal benefit for women and men? Does the project include the monitoring mechanism to assess the gender differentiate impacts on women?	Yes	Not Satisfactory	No

To help understand in more detail if projects considered gender issues, the following checklist were developed.

Checklists for review/ analysis:

The checklists were developed in line with Bangladesh Government's Women Development Policy-2011 particularly focusing on Article no 36. (Women and Environment) and Article no.37 (Predisaster, during disaster and post disaster protection of women and children).

The recognition of the differentiated gender needs

- Does the project count/consider different population group?
- Does the project consider gender -differentiated vulnerabilities?
- Does the project identify the gender needs (Practical or strategic)?
- Does the project consider women's capacity or knowledge about environment?

Adaptive Gender Responsive supports/services

- Are benefits of the project for both women and men equally distributed?
- Do women have the accessibility of the services or activities of the project?
- Do women have equal opportunities to access the services?

Adequate participation and leadership of different gender/sex groups

- Does the project consider women as an equal stakeholder?
- How women are included in the project activities?
- Have women in leadership position in the project activities?

Gender responsive steps to review equal benefits

- What are the steps to assess the benefits of the projects?
- Does the projects have the gender segregated data /information?
- Does the project have the option of gender analysis for monitoring or evaluation?